

ATTACHMENT 1

Overview of the Instructional Materials Quality Evaluation Pilot Rubric

Background on the Instructional Material Quality Reviews

Teachers and students deserve the highest quality instructional materials that not only align to the TEKS but also reflect research-based instructional practices that provide teachers with the support they need to challenge their students and inspire them to learn and grow. Local education agencies (LEAs) across Texas are eager to purchase the best materials for their teachers and students, a desire which is backed by the growing body of research showing that selecting high-quality instructional materials is one of the most successful and cost-effective ways to improve student outcomes.¹

A common challenge among teachers, schools, and LEAs is finding the time, expertise, and information necessary to identify strong materials. Often materials adoption processes are hampered by the realities of time and capacity at the local level, and without support, it can be difficult to discern differences about the quality among multiple programs that are labeled and marketed to meet the needs of all.

Written into statute in 2017 (Texas Education Code § 31.081 and § 31.082), TEA will facilitate an independent analysis of the quality of instructional materials. This process will empower and strengthen local decision-making and make it easier for educators at all levels to attend to the specific, unique needs of their students. LEAs will have complete autonomy to decide if and how they use the reviews as part of their local review and adoption processes.

Development of the Draft ELAR 3-8 Pilot Rubric

To ensure accurate, transparent, and reliable reviews, materials will be evaluated by teams of highly-trained [reviewers](#)—consisting of Texas teachers and other content experts—using a Texas-specific rubric. The DRAFT rubric below, which will evolve over the next month, will be used by review teams to evaluate the quality of **English language arts and reading (ELAR) materials for grades 3-8** during the [pilot](#) phase of this project.

TEA will solicit feedback from Texas educators and experts to hone the quality criteria, improve labeling language (terms, titles, etc.), and identify user-friendly classifications for reviewed materials to signal quality (e.g. stars, tiers, colors). Once finalized for the pilot, this rubric will be shared publicly so it is readily available to LEAs, publishers, education service centers (ESCs), and parents. **Please use this [form](#) to provide feedback.**

Design of the Draft ELAR 3-8 Pilot Rubric

The goal of ELAR is for students to read, understand, and express understanding of complex texts independently. To accomplish this goal, instructional materials must build students' knowledge and skill in language, comprehension, conversations, and writing integrated around a volume of complex texts and tasks.² In grades K-5, materials must also build students' foundational skills to be able to read and write about a range of texts independently.³ Materials must also be closely aligned to the TEKS and easy for teachers to use.

¹ Steiner, David. (2017, March) Curriculum Research: What We Know and Where We Need to Go. StandardsWork

² A volume of texts is a collection of texts written about similar topics, themes, or ideas.

³ A range of texts are texts written at different reading levels.

Therefore, this draft rubric includes the following broad categories that reviewers will use to capture and report information about the programs to help Texas educators differentiate between quality:

- 1) **TEKS and ELPS alignment:** how well do the materials align to Texas’s unique standards and context?
- 2) **Quality and variety of texts:** what will students read, see, and hear?
- 3) **Questions and tasks:** how will students express their understanding of complex texts, and to what extent do these skills integrate with one another?
- 4) **Developing and Sustaining Foundational Literacy Skills**(for limited grades): to what extent do the materials build the foundational skills (e.g. fluency) that students need to read and write about texts independently?
- 5) **Supports for Diverse Learners:** how well do the materials support teachers in meeting the needs of with diverse learning needs?
- 6) **Ease of Use and Supports for Implementation:** how teacher-friendly are the materials and how do they support teachers and administrators ensure strong implementation?

Each category includes a series of more detailed indicators to help educators determine why or why not a certain program is considered high quality.

IMPORTANT NOTE:

This rubric and review process are not intended to capture all the qualities that high-quality ELAR materials should encompass. There are many other components within a set of instructional materials that may support students in their development in literacy. This rubric and process are intended to provide information for teachers, schools, and LEAs to discern quality components among programs to assist them in making the best choice for their students.

How to read the Draft Rubric

Criterion/Category - This is the broadest category level. This is the “forest view.”

Indicator - These make up the details within the categories. Together they are the “trees” that make the “forest.”

1.1 Indicator

1.2 Indicator

Note on Existing SBOE TEKS Alignment Process

The quality review process is designed to be complementary to the TEKS alignment process. All materials that are reviewed for quality will also complete the TEKS alignment review which results in a percentage of TEKS coverage for a specific set of materials. The TEKS alignment process is designed to capture one threshold level of alignment (what standards are met). The quality review process, with the support of this rubric, will provide a broad overview of additional criteria required to determine high quality materials (how well standards are met). The rubric identifies which quality components are present and how the instructional materials’ components work together to support students and teachers in the classroom.

TEA ELAR 3-8 Pilot Rubric DRAFT

[Feedback form](#)

I. TEKS and ELPS Alignment (percent of standards met in materials) State review panel members review instructional materials to determine the extent to which the TEKS and ELPS are covered and to identify factual errors. To be eligible for adoption, instructional materials must meet at least 50% of the TEKS and 100% of the required ELPS in the components intended for student use and the components intended for teacher use, be free from factual error, meet manufacturing specifications, be suitable for the intended course and grade level, and be reviewed by academic experts.
Indicators
I.1 Percentage of standards met (as determined by SBOE process)
I.2 Percent of required ELPS met (as determined by SBOE process)

II. Texts (what students read, see, and hear) Materials must include a wide variety and range of high-quality literary and informational texts that are appropriately challenging for the grade.	
Indicators	Guidance for Texas Quality
II.1 Materials include high-quality texts for ELA instruction and cover a range of student interests.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The texts are well-crafted (e.g., representing the quality of content, language, and writing that is produced by experts in various disciplines).• Materials include texts of contemporary and classic and traditional literature from Western Civilization, as well as various cultural settings of relevance to Texas students.• Texts must include those outlined for specific grades by the TEKS:<ul style="list-style-type: none">○ Literary texts must include those outlined for specific grades (e.g., works of fiction, poetry, drama)○ Nonfiction materials include texts of information, exposition, procedures, and documents .• Materials include opportunities for students to analyze the use of print features (e.g., maps, charts, illustrations, graphs, timelines, tables, and diagrams)
II.2 Materials include a variety of text types and genres across multiple disciplines (e.g., support connections to science and social studies) that meet the requirements of the TEKS for each grade level. (found on page 14 of vertical alignment)	
II.3 Texts are at an appropriate level of challenge and complexity to support students at their grade level.	

III. Questions and Tasks (what students are asked to write, speak, and demonstrate)

Materials provide questions and tasks for students to both develop and deepen comprehension of texts and topics. Students demonstrate grade level literacy skills through reading, writing, listening, and speaking opportunities that require use of text evidence for response. Materials contain meaningful, interconnected questions tasks that build student knowledge. Tasks integrate reading, writing, speaking and listening, and include components of vocabulary, syntax, and fluency, as needed, and provide opportunities for increased independence.

Indicators

Guidance for Texas Quality

III.1 Materials contain high quality questions and tasks that support students in analyzing and integrating knowledge, ideas, themes, and connections within and across texts.

- Most questions and tasks build conceptual knowledge, are text-specific/dependent, target complex elements of the texts, and integrate multiple TEKS.
- Most formal and informal assignments and activities focus on texts students are reading/hearing and require close attention to the meaning and inferences as students demonstrate comprehension.
- Students critically analyze vocabulary, form, and meaning of texts. Questions and tasks require students to:
 - identify and discuss important big ideas and details
 - demonstrate clear comprehension of the texts.
 - make connections to personal experiences, other texts, and the world around them.
 - analyze, make inferences and draw conclusions about the author's purpose in cultural, historical, and contemporary contexts, and provide evidence from the text to support their understanding.
 - compare and contrast the stated or implied purposes of different authors writing on the same topic.
- Questions and tasks support students' analysis of the literary elements of texts by:
 - asking students to identify author's purpose and craft (in single and multiple texts).
 - asking students to analyze the author's choices and how they influence and communicate meaning (in single and within a variety of texts).
 - asking students to study the language of the texts.
- Questions ask students to describe personal connections to a variety of sources.

III.2 Materials provide support for students to develop composition skills across multiple text types for a variety of purposes and audiences.

- Materials facilitate students' coherent use of the elements of the writing process (planning, drafting, revising, editing, and publishing) to compose text.
- Materials provide students opportunities to write texts for multiple purposes and audiences:
 - Students write literary texts to express their ideas and feelings about real or imagined people, events, and ideas.
 - Students write personal narratives that convey thoughts and feelings about an experience.
 - Students write expository and procedural or work-related texts to communicate

III. Questions and Tasks (what students are asked to write, speak, and demonstrate)

Materials provide questions and tasks for students to both develop and deepen comprehension of texts and topics. Students demonstrate grade level literacy skills through reading, writing, listening, and speaking opportunities that require use of text evidence for response. Materials contain meaningful, interconnected questions tasks that build student knowledge. Tasks integrate reading, writing, speaking and listening, and include components of vocabulary, syntax, and fluency, as needed, and provide opportunities for increased independence.

Indicators	Guidance for Texas Quality
	<p>ideas and information to specific audiences for specific purposes.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Students write persuasive texts to influence the attitudes or actions of a specific audience on specific issues. ○ Students write persuasive essays for appropriate audiences that establish a position and include sound reasoning, detailed and relevant evidence, and consideration of alternatives. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Materials provide opportunities for students to read and write in cursive
<p>III.3 Over the course of the year, composition convention skills are applied in increasingly complex contexts, with opportunities for students to publish their writing.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Materials provide practice and application opportunities for students to use the conventions of academic language when speaking and writing, including punctuation and grammar.
<p>III.4 Materials support students’ listening and speaking about texts and research. As well as the opportunity to give organized presentations in both formal and informal settings.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Materials provide opportunities for students to listen closely to and correctly interpret a speaker's messages (both verbal and nonverbal) and ask questions to clarify the speaker's purpose or perspective. ● Materials provide practice for students to follow, restate, and give oral instructions that include multiple action steps and determine both main and supporting ideas in the speaker's message. ● Materials provide opportunities for students to give organized presentations, speak clearly and to the point, using the conventions of language.
<p>III.5 Coherent sequences of questions and activities focus students on understanding the text and its illustrations (as applicable), making connections among the texts in the collection, and expressing their understanding of the topics, themes, and/or ideas presented in the texts.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The activities and questions with which students engage support students’ analysis and understanding of language use, comprehension of details and craft of texts that are increasingly challenging over the course of school year. ● Questions and activities grow their understanding of topics and literacy skills over the course of each unit. ● Materials provide opportunities for students to analyze and integrate information and from multiple places within a text and across multiple texts.
<p>III.6 Most oral and written tasks require students to use clear information and well-defended, text-supported claims to demonstrate the</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Oral and written tasks provide students practice in applying the language critical to conveying their purpose and the content and meaning of texts. This may include deep practice with new vocabulary in multiple types of texts.

III. Questions and Tasks (what students are asked to write, speak, and demonstrate)

Materials provide questions and tasks for students to both develop and deepen comprehension of texts and topics. Students demonstrate grade level literacy skills through reading, writing, listening, and speaking opportunities that require use of text evidence for response. Materials contain meaningful, interconnected questions tasks that build student knowledge. Tasks integrate reading, writing, speaking and listening, and include components of vocabulary, syntax, and fluency, as needed, and provide opportunities for increased independence.

Indicators	Guidance for Texas Quality
knowledge gained through analysis and synthesis of texts. All tasks should require the use of grade-level language and conventions.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Materials provide study and practice of newly acquired vocabulary to express in speaking and writing.
III.7 Materials engage students in productive teams and in student-led discussions by eliciting and considering suggestions from other group members and by identifying points of agreement and disagreement.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Materials provide consistent opportunities for students to practice discussions and oral presentations using grade level appropriate protocols Materials provide consistent opportunities for students to engage in discussions that require support of sources in accurate and focused manner.
III.8 Materials engage students in both short-term and sustained recursive inquiry processes to confront and analyze various aspects of a topic using relevant sources.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Materials support identification and summary of high-quality primary and secondary sources (e.g., vetted reference texts, periodicals, web pages, online sources, and data from experts). Students organize and present their ideas and information according to the purpose of the research and their audience at their grade level.
III.9 Materials include a cohesive, year-long plan for students to interact with and build key content and academic vocabulary words in and across texts.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Materials include a year-long plan for building academic vocabulary, including ways to apply words in appropriate contexts. Materials include scaffolds and supports for teachers to differentiate vocabulary development for all learners.
III.10 Materials include a clearly defined plan to support and hold students accountable as they engage in independent reading.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Procedures and/or protocols, along with adequate support for teachers, are provided to foster independent reading. Materials provide adequate support and guidance to teachers. Materials provide a plan for students to self-select texts and read independently for a sustained period of time, including accountability and planning for achieving goals for independent reading.
III.11. Materials include practice for students to write complete words, thoughts, and answers legibly in cursive. (Elementary level only)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Materials include instruction in cursive handwriting for students in the appropriate grade(s). Materials include a plan for procedures and supports for teachers to assess and differentiate cursive instruction is included.

IV. Developing and Sustaining Foundational Literacy Skills (Grades 3-5)

Materials follow a sequence of appropriate foundational skills instruction indicated by the TEKS while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.

Indicators	Guidance for Texas Quality
IV.1 Materials include clear diagnostic tools and progressions of instruction connected to those tools to support students. Opportunities to assess student mastery in and out of context are offered at regular intervals.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">● Materials follow a sequence of appropriate foundational skills instruction indicated by the TEKS while providing abundant opportunities for every student to become proficient in each of the foundational skills.● Materials support the teacher to work with students to self-monitor, and use context to confirm or self-correct understanding and word recognition, and employ rereading when appropriate.● Materials include spelling support as identified in the TEKS.● Materials include support and direction for teachers to assess students' growth in and mastery of foundational skills (e.g., skill gaps in phonics and decoding) in and out of context● Materials support teachers with guidance and direction to respond to individual students' literacy needs, based on assessments appropriate to the grade level.
IV.2 Materials provide instruction and practice in word analysis, including systematic examination of grade-level prefixes and suffixes, decoding of multisyllabic words by using syllabication, and automaticity with grade-level regular and irregular spelling patterns in context and out of context.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">● In grades 3-5, materials demand knowledge of grade-level phonic patterns and word analysis skills as delineated in the TEKS for grades 3-5.● Materials specifically attend to supporting students in need of effective remediation.
IV.3 Materials provide frequent opportunities for students to practice and develop oral and silent reading fluency while reading a wide variety of grade-appropriate texts at the appropriate rate with accuracy and expression.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">● Materials provide students opportunity to read at-grade level texts as they make meaning and build foundational skills.● Material include direct instruction in fluency, including phrasing, intonation, and accuracy.● Materials include opportunities for feedback and self-assessment cues.● Materials provide opportunities for teachers to regularly monitor and provide corrective feedback on rate, accuracy, and expression are built into the materials and routines.

V. Supports for Diverse Learners

Materials provide guidance and support that help teacher meet students' diverse learning needs.

Indicators	Guidance for Texas Quality
V.1 Materials include year-long plans and supports for teachers to identify needs of students and provide differentiation to meet the needs of a range of learners to assure grade-level success.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Materials provide an overarching year-long plan for teachers to engage students in multiple grouping (and other) structures, including alternate pacing and delivery options, etc. Plans are comprehensive and attend to differentiation to support students in myriad learning opportunities.
V.2 Materials include supports for students who demonstrate proficiency above grade level.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Materials provide planning and learning opportunities (including extensions and differentiation) for students who demonstrate literacy skills above that expected at the grade level.
V.3 Materials include supports for students who perform below grade level to assure they are meeting the grade level literacy standards.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Materials provide all students, including those who read below grade level with extensive opportunities and support to encounter and comprehend grade-level complex text as by the TEKS.
V.4 Materials include supports that help English language learners (ELL) to meet grade-level learning expectations.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Materials must include accommodations for linguistics (communicated, sequenced, and scaffolded) commensurate with various levels of English language proficiency as defined by the ELPs.• Materials provide scaffolds such as adapted text, translations, native language support, cognates, summaries, pictures, realia, glossaries, bilingual dictionaries, thesauri, and other modes of comprehensible input.• Materials encourage strategic use of students' first language as a means to linguistic, affective, cognitive, and academic development in English (e.g. to enhance vocabulary development)• Vocabulary is developed in the context of connected discourse. Strategic use of the student's first language is important

VI. Ease of Use and Supports for Implementation

Materials provide support for implementation including clear and easy-to-follow guidance and support for teachers and administrators.

Indicators	Guidance for Texas Quality
<p>VI.1 Materials include implementation support for teachers and administrators</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials include a school year’s worth of literacy instruction, including realistic pacing guidance and routines and support for both 180-day and 220-day schedules. • Materials are accompanied by a TEKS-aligned scope and sequence outlining the essential knowledge and skills that are taught in the program, the order in which they are presented, and how knowledge and skills build and connect across grade levels. • Units and lessons contain clear, articulated objectives and learning goals aligned to the TEKS. • Materials include additional supports to help teachers implement the materials as intended (e.g. exemplar videos, suggestions for how to use PLC time to prepare to teach lessons) • Materials include additional implementation supports for administrators (e.g. “look for” guides, suggested supports for common challenges teachers face with implementation)
<p>VI.2 Teacher edition materials include annotation and support for engaging students in the materials, as well as support for implementing ancillary and resource materials and student progress components.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials include appropriate use of white space and design that supports student learning (and does not distract). • Annotations and ancillary materials provide support student learning and assistance for teachers. • Technology supports and enhances student learning, and includes teacher guidance as to implementation. • Materials include guidance and protocols for teachers to measure student progress over the course of the year.
<p>VI.3 Materials include assessment information and guidance for teachers to interpret and act on data yielded.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Assessments and scoring information provides sufficient guidance for interpreting and responding to student performance. • Assessments include clear purpose and intended use, and identify which TEKS are being emphasized. • Assessments included should be connected to the regular content to support student learning as they provide information on student progress.
<p>VI.4 Technology components included are appropriate for grade level students and provide support for learning.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Materials support effective use of technology to enhance students’ literacy learning, not only increase student engagement. • Digital learning is accessible and available in multiple platforms.