Item 4:
Approval of August 1, 2014 Board Meeting Minutes

ACTION

DESIRED OUTCOME: The Board will approve the minutes of the August 1, 2014 Board meeting.

ASSOCIATE COMMISSIONER’S RECOMMENDATION: I recommend that the State Board for Educator Certification approve the minutes as recorded.

Respectfully submitted,

Ryan Franklin
Interim Associate Commissioner
Educator Leadership and Quality
1. Call to Order

The State Board for Educator Certification convened its meeting at 9:01 a.m. on Friday, August 1, 2014, in Room 1-104 of the William B. Travis Building, 1701 N. Congress Avenue in Austin, Texas.

Present: Dr. Cain, Mr. Berry, Mr. Leal, Ms. Bricker, Ms. Robison, Ms. Everest, Dr. Simpson, Dr. Hull, Dr. Loredo, Dr. Buckingham, Mr. Allard, Ms. McCall, Ms. Druesedow

Absent: Ms. Bridges

Dr. Cain introduced two new Board members: Dr. Susan Simpson Hull and Mr. Leon Leal.

Ms. Everest announced that Board member Suzanne McCall was selected as Teacher of the Year in Region 17.

2. Associate Commissioner’s Comments Regarding the SBEC Agenda

Ryan Franklin welcomed the new Board members and noted that Texas Education Agency (TEA) staff will try to schedule an orientation for the new Board members and other members who want to attend before the October Board meeting. Mr. Franklin introduced Dr. Tim Miller, new director for educator preparation programs and Jan Lindsey, new director for educator initiatives.

3. Public Comment

None

CONSENT AGENDA

4. Approval of April 4, 2014 Board Workshop Minutes

5. Approval of May 2, 2014 Board Meeting Minutes

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Everest to accept the consent agenda as is. Second was made by Dr. Buckingham and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

DISCUSSION AND ACTION

6. Proposed Revisions to the Board Operating Policies and Procedures (BOPP)
Mr. Byer explained the proposed changes to the BOPP related to the election of officers of the Board.

**Motion and vote:**

Motion was made by Ms. Bricker to accept the proposed revisions to SBEC Board Operating Policies and Procedures. Second was made by Ms. Druesedow and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

7. **Election of Board Vice-Chairperson**

**Motion and vote:**

Motion was made by Ms. Bricker to nominate Dr. Buckingham for Vice-Chairperson of the Board. Second was made by Ms. Everest. No other nominations were received and Dr. Buckingham was elected by acclamation.

8. **Approval of 2015 Board Meeting Dates**

**Motion and vote:**

Motion was made by Ms. McCall to adopt the proposed 2015 meeting dates. Second was made by Dr. Hull and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

9. **Litigation Settlement Options in Pending or Contemplated Litigation, Disciplinary Cases, and Pending Litigation (10:00 a.m.)**

**A. Contested Cases**

**I. No Answer Defaults**


   Staff recommendation: 2 year suspension


   Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation


   Staff recommendation: Revocation

   Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation


   Staff recommendation: 1 year suspension


   Staff recommendation: 1 year suspension


   Staff recommendation: Revocation


    Staff recommendation: 1 year suspension


    Staff recommendation: Revocation


    Staff recommendation: 3 year suspension


    Staff recommendation: 1 year suspension

Staff recommendation: Revocation


Staff recommendation: 1 year suspension


Staff recommendation: Revocation

17) Docket No. 5078-EC-0414, Texas Education Agency, Educator Leadership and Quality Division v. Maria Balderas Villanueva a/k/a Maria F. Balderas; Action to be taken: Consideration of Issuance of Default Judgment.

Staff recommendation: Revocation


Staff recommendation: Revocation


Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation


Staff recommendation: Permanent Revocation


Staff recommendation: Revocation

Staff recommendation: Revocation


Staff recommendation: 1 year suspension


Staff recommendation: Revocation


Staff recommendation: Revocation


Staff recommendation: Revocation


Staff recommendation: Revocation

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Ms. Robison to approve staff’s request for issuance of default judgments and enter a Final Order consistent with staff’s recommendation for each of the above numbered cases 1-27, with the exception of cases 3 and 4. Second was made by Ms. Everest and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*


Staff recommendation: 2 year suspension
Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Bricker to issue a final order of permanent revocation. Second was made by Dr. Hull.

Motion was made by Mr. Allard to amend the original motion from permanent revocation to revocation. Second by Ms. McCall and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Motion was made by Mr. Allard to issue a final order of revocation. Second by Ms. Druesedow and voted unanimously in favor of the motion.


Staff recommendation: 2 year suspension

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Bricker to issue a final order of permanent revocation. The motion failed for a lack of second.

Motion was made by Dr. Hull to issue a final order of revocation. Second was made by Ms. McCall and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

II. Proposals for Decision


ALJ Recommendation: Revocation

Staff Recommendation: Revocation

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Druesedow to accept the proposal for decision and issue a final order consistent with the ALJ’s recommendation of revocation. Second was made by Ms. McCall and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

III. Motion for Rehearing

None

IV. Appeals

1) State Board for Educator Certification v. Robert D. Lange; Cause No. 03-12-00453-CV, In the Court of Appeals, Third Judicial District, Austin, Texas.
2) *State Board for Educator Certification v. Erasmo Montalvo*; Cause No. 03-13-00370-CV, In the Court of Appeals, Third Judicial District, Austin, Texas.

3) *State Board for Educator Certification v. Erasmo Montalvo*; Cause No. 13-0537, In the Supreme Court, Austin, Texas.

4) *Barry Ryan Davis v. Texas Education Agency, Educator Certification and Standards Division*; Cause No. D-1-GN-12-003413, In the 201st District Court of Travis County, Texas.

5) *Don Madden v. State Board for Educator Certification*; Case No. 14-0532, In the Supreme Court of Texas.

**B. Pending Litigation**

The Board may discuss any other litigation arising after the date of posting or reasonably contemplated as of the date of the board meeting.

None.

Recess at 11:52 p.m.
Reconvene at 12:07 p.m.

10. Consideration of and Opportunity to Approve New Classes of Certificates

Dr. Miller presented requests from LeTourneau University for approval to offer the school counselor certificate and from Texas A&M University – Central Texas in Killeen for the school counselor, reading specialist and superintendent certificates.

**Motion and vote:**

Motion was made by Ms. Robison to approve the new classes of certificates for LeTourneau University and Texas A&M University – Central Texas in Killeen. Second was made by Ms. Bricker and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

11. Consideration of and Opportunity to Approve a New Educator Preparation Program

Dr. Miller presented a request for approval from Relay Graduate School of Education to offer an alternative certification program in Houston, Texas.

**Motion and vote:**

Motion was made by Ms. Bricker to approve Relay Graduate School of Education Alternative Certification Program in Houston, Texas, as a new educator preparation program. Second was made by Dr. Hull and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.
12. Consideration of and Opportunity to Approve New Members of the Educator Preparation Advisory Committee

Dr. Miller presented a list of potential committee members for the Educator Preparation Advisory Committee.

The Board asked to see the committee members’ titles/positions on the list in the future.

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Ms. Druesedow to approve the appointment of the new Educator Preparation Advisory Committee members. Second was made by Ms. Bricker and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*

13. Consideration of and Opportunity to Approve Passing Standards on New Texas Examinations of Educator Standards (TExES)

Ms. Cook presented the passing standards for four new Texas Examinations of Educator Standards (TExES): Pedagogy and Professional Responsibilities for Trade and Industrial Education 6-12, Mathematics/Physical Science/Engineering 6-12, Physics/Mathematics 7-12, and Journalism 7-12.

The Board asked to see the committee members’ titles/positions on the list in the future.

**Motion and vote:**

*Motion was made by Ms. Robison to approve the passing standards for these four new certification examinations, which will allow candidates in educator preparation programs to meet proficiency requirements for certification. Second was made by Dr. Buckingham and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.*


Mr. Byer asked the Board to address this item after item 20.

Public comment was provided by Jennifer Canaday and Patty Quinzi.

Mr. Byer presented this item to the Board. The proposed amendment to 19 TAC §249.15 would conform this section to the proposed amendments approved by the SBEC to 19 TAC Chapter 229, Accountability System for Educator Preparation Programs. The proposed amendment to 19 TAC §249.16 would clarify that multiple statutory provisions provide the basis for certification actions based on criminal history.
Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Everest to approve the proposed amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 249, Disciplinary Proceedings, Sanctions, and Contested Cases, Subchapter B, Enforcement Actions and Guidelines; §249.15, Disciplinary Action by State Board for Educator Certification, and §249.16, Eligibility of Persons with Criminal Convictions for a Certificate under Texas Occupations Code, Chapter 53, to be published as proposed with the Texas Register. Second was made by Ms. Druesedow. Seven members voted in favor and one voted against. The motion carried.

15. Proposed Amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 233, Categories of Classroom Teaching Certificates

Ms. Cook presented this item to add the Core Subjects certificates into Chapter 233. Substitute text was provided to correct the dates to 2017 in §233.13 (e) and (g).

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Robison to approve the proposed amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 233, Categories of Classroom Teaching Certificates, §§233.1, General Authority; 233.2, Generalist; 233.6, Bilingual Education; 233.7, English as a Second Language; and 233.13, Career and Technical Education (Certificates not requiring experience and preparation in a skill area), to be published as proposed with the Texas Register, as amended. Second was made by Ms. Bricker and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

16. Proposed Amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 231, Requirements for Public School Personnel Assignments, Subchapter B, Prekindergarten-Grade 6 Assignments, and Subchapter C, Grades 6-8 Assignments

Ms. Cook presented this item to make changes to the assignment rules, adding Core Subjects where appropriate.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Everest to approve the proposed amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 231, Requirements for Public School Personnel Assignments, Subchapter B, Prekindergarten-Grade 6 Assignments, and Subchapter C, Grades 6-8 Assignments, to be published as proposed with the Texas Register. Second was made by Ms. McCall and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

17. Adoption of Proposed Amendment to 19 TAC Chapter 249, Disciplinary Proceedings, Sanctions, and Contested Cases, Subchapter B, Enforcement Actions and Guidelines, §249.17, Decision-Making Guidelines

Mr. Byer presented this item for final adoption. The amendment would clarify the SBEC rule regarding the types of conduct that would result in permanent revocation or denial of a certificate and actions in other states that could result in disciplinary action in Texas.
Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Dr. Hull to approve for adoption, subject to State Board of Education review, the proposed amendment to 19 TAC Chapter 249, Disciplinary Proceedings, Sanctions, and Contested Cases, Subchapter B, Enforcement Actions and Guidelines, §249.17, Decision-Making Guidelines, with an effective date of 20 days after filing the adoption notice with the Texas Register. Second was made by Ms. Druesedow and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

18. Adoption of Proposed Revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 227, Provisions for Educator Preparation Candidates

Public comment was provided by Jeremy Scott Fikes, John-Peter Lund, Kate Kuhlmann, Diann Huber, Jill Marshall, Melva Cardenas, Dr. Rae Queen and Dr. Rosemary Robbins.

Dr. Miller presented this item to the Board. The proposed revisions are necessary as a result of House Bill (HB) 2012, 83rd Texas Legislature, Regular Session, 2013, to update the rules to reflect current law, clarify minimum standards for all EPPs, allow for flexibility, and ensure consistency among EPPs in the state.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Bricker to approve proposed revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 227, Provisions for Educator Preparation Candidates, inclusive of the admission criteria that the grade point average be increased to 2.75. Second was made by Ms. McCall.

Motion was made by Ms. Robison to amend the original motion to replace the GPA with 2.5. Second was made by Mr. Leal. Eight members voted in favor; two voted against. The motion carried.

Motion was made by Ms. Robison to approve for adoption, as amended, subject to State Board of Education review, the proposed revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 227, Provisions for Educator Preparation Candidates, §§227.1, 227.5, 227.10, 227.15, 227.20, 227.103, 227.105, and 227.107, with an effective date of March 1, 2015, and proposed new 19 TAC §227.17, with an effective date of January 1, 2015. Second was made by Dr. Hull and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

19. Adoption of Proposed Amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 228, Requirements for Educator Preparation Programs

Public comment was provided by Kenneth Evans and Howell Wright.

Dr. Miller presented this item to the Board. The proposed revisions are necessary as a result of HB 2012, 83rd Texas Legislature, Regular Session, 2013, to update the rules to reflect current law, clarify minimum standards for all EPPs, allow for flexibility, and ensure consistency among EPPs in the state.
Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Ms. Bricker to strike §228.35 (g)(2). Second was made by Dr. Hull and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Motion was made by Dr. Hull to add “and C-2” to the end of §228.30(b)(5). Second was made by Mr. Allard and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Motion was made by Ms. Everest to retain language relating to clinical teaching as §228.30(c) that was previously stricken. Second was made by Ms. McCall and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Motion was made by Dr. Hull to approve for adoption, as amended, subject to State Board of Education review, the proposed amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 228, Requirements for Educator Preparation Programs, with an effective date of 20 days after filing the adoption notice with the Texas Register. Second was made by Ms. Druesedow and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

20. Adoption of Proposed Amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 229, Accountability System for Educator Preparation Programs, §§229.2-229.8, and Withdrawal of Proposed Amendment to 19 TAC §229.9, Fees for Educator Preparation Program Approval and Accountability

Public comment was provided by Jennifer Canaday.

Dr. Miller presented this item to the Board. The proposed amendment is necessary as a result of HB 2012, 83rd Texas Legislature, Regular Session, 2013, to update and make uniform definitions, modify the standards used for enforcing the reporting of data, clarify the standards used for accountability, adjust the small group exception requirements, and establish a new process for challenging sanctions imposed on programs that fail the accountability system.

Motion and vote:

Motion was made by Dr. Hull to approve an amendment to change the word “shall” to “may” in §229.3(b), (c), and (d). Second was made by Ms. Everest and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

Motion was made by Mr. Allard to approve for adoption, as amended, subject to State Board of Education review, the proposed amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 229, Accountability System for Educator Preparation Programs, §§229.2-229.8, with an effective date of 20 days after filing the adoption notice with the Texas Register; and withdraw the proposed amendment to 19 TAC Chapter 229, Accountability System for Educator Preparation Programs, §229.9, Fees for Educator Preparation Program Approval and Accountability, that was published in the Texas Register. Second was made by Ms. Druesedow and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.
21. Adoption of Proposed Amendment to 19 TAC Chapter 250, Administration, Subchapter B, Rulemaking Procedures, §250.20, Petition for Adoption of Rules or Rule Changes

Mr. Byer presented this item to the Board. The proposed amendment clarifies references to the Texas Education Agency (TEA) and updates the petition form to reflect the name of the office to which the form should be mailed.

**Motion and vote:**

Motion was made by Ms. McCall to approve for adoption, subject to State Board of Education review, the proposed amendment to 19 TAC Chapter 250, Administration, Subchapter B, Rulemaking Procedures, §250.20, Petition for Adoption of Rules or Rule Changes, with an effective date of 20 days after filing the adoption notice with the Texas Register. Second was made by Mr. Leal and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.

22. Consideration of Petition for Adoption of Rule Change Concerning 19 TAC Chapter 239, Student Services Certificates, Subchapter B, School Librarian Certificate, §239.60, Requirements for the Issuance of the Standard School Librarian Certificate

The petitioner, Vanessa Corral, presented this item on her own behalf.

Ms. Cook answered questions from the Board. This petition requests an amendment to 19 TAC §239.60(4) that would allow the experience of teaching in a school setting for 15 hours a week or more, whether as an academic tutor or any other related experience to be considered comparable to the two creditable years of teaching experience as a classroom teacher.

**Motion and vote:**

Motion was made by Dr. Hull to initiate rulemaking with regard to librarian certification in §239.60. Second was made by Mr. Leal and the Board voted unanimously in favor of the motion.


Dr. Miller presented this discussion item to the Board. In response to a Sunset Advisory Commission recommendation that fees in rule for educator certification and educator preparation programs be evaluated and adjusted to cover costs and ensure equity, TEA staff is conducting a study of the actual costs of services and will provide information to the SBEC at the October meeting.
24. Discussion of Educator Preparation Program Complaints Procedures

Dr. Miller presented this discussion item to the Board. In response to a Sunset Advisory Commission recommendation that procedures for EPP complaints outline all phases of the EPP complaint process, as well as track and analyze complaint data, TEA staff is developing proposed rule action to bring to the Board at the October meeting.

25. Update on Sunset Report

a) TEA staff reports and Board member letters on SBEC progress in addressing issues raised by the Sunset Commission or its staff for the 2013 legislature

b) Current and upcoming Sunset-related activity

Mr. Franklin gave the Board an update on Sunset related issues. The Sunset Commission is scheduled to meet November 12 or 13 for a public meeting. The report from Sunset staff on limited scope review is expected in October. Commission members will vote in December.

26. Requests from Board Members for Future Agenda Items

Legislative Committee briefing/update. Mr. Franklin requested Board members send Cheryl an email to indicate interest in serving on the Legislative Committee. Dr. Cain asked TEA staff to email the Board members not present.

Dr. Cain indicated every Board member interested will be appointed to the Legislative Committee and appointed Mr. Allard as the chair of the committee.

27. Requests Received from the Board Since Last Meeting

Mr. Berry updated the Board on the requested transcripts from the August and October 2013 SBEC meetings. The requested transcripts have been delivered.

28. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 2:07 p.m.