

# Compliance Audit Report 2012-2013 Huston-Tillotson University Initial Teacher Certification Program

According to Texas Administrative Code (TAC) §228.10(c), "An entity approved by the SBEC under this chapter...shall be reviewed at least once every five years under procedures approved by the Texas Education Agency (TEA) staff; however, a review may be conducted at any time at the discretion of the TEA staff." Per TAC §228.1(c), "All educator preparation programs are subject to the same standards of accountability, as required under Chapter 229 of this title." The Texas Education Agency administers Texas Administrative Code rules required by the Texas legislature for the regulation of all educator preparation programs in the state. Please see the complete Texas Administrative Code at www.tea.state.tx.us for details.

**Contact Information:** Huston-Tillotson University Dr. Ruth Kane, <u>rakane@htu.edu</u>, (512) 505-3091 900 Chicon Street Austin, TX 78702

# County/District Number: 227-503

#### TEA Approval Date on Record: November 2006

Program Specialists, Danielle Warren, Scott Lewis, and Mixon Henry conducted a Texas Education Agency Compliance Audit of Huston-Tillotson University Educator Preparation Program (EPP) located at 900 Chicon Street, Austin, TX 78702 on May 21-23, 2013. The focus of the compliance audit was the undergraduate initial teacher certification program and the Generalist EC-6 certificate. The following are findings and recommendations for program improvement.

#### Scope of the Compliance Audit:

The scope of this audit is restricted solely to verifying compliance with Texas Administrative Code (TAC) §227, §228. §229, and §230.

#### Data Analysis:

Information concerning compliance with Texas Administrative Code (TAC) governing educator preparation programs was collected by various quantitative and qualitative methodologies. A self-report was submitted to the Texas Education Agency on April 23, 2013. An on-site review of documents, student records, course material, online courses, and curriculum correlations charts

provided evidence regarding compliance. In addition, electronic questionnaires developed by TEA were sent to current and past Huston-Tillotson University traditional certification program stakeholders. A total of eighty-four (84) questionnaires were sent to stakeholders. A total of thirty-five (35) responses out of the eighty-four (84) or 42% were received as follows: eight (8) out of eleven (11) advisory committee members (73%), ten (10) out of twenty-five (25) educator candidates (40%), fourteen (14) out of twenty-eight (28) cooperating teachers/mentors (50%), one (1) out of one (1) field supervisor (100%), and two (2) out of nineteen (19) campus principals/administrators (11%). Qualitative and quantitative methodologies of content analysis, cross-referencing, and triangulation of the data were used to evaluate the evidence. Evidence of compliance was determined using a rubric aligned with Texas Administrative Code.

# **Opening and Closing Sessions:**

The opening session on May 21, 2013, was attended by seventeen (17) people, including the following leadership: Dr. Vicki Lott (Provost), Dr. Linda Jackson (Director of Public Relations and Marketing), Susan Browne, Lauralee Pankonien (ESC XIII Certification Officer), Dr. Jan Seiter (ATCP Director), Dr. Rita Mitchell, Antonio Hollyway (Assistant Director of Financial Aid), Diane Nunoz (Financial Aid Specialist), Dr. Archie Vanderpuye (Associate Provost), Dr. Deanna Mercer, Raymond Rose, Dr. Darla Smith, Jo Ann Schatz (Consultant), Donna G. Dagar, Dr. Rozena McCabe (Interim Dean, Colleges of Arts and Sciences), Dr. Eric Budd, Elvarina Hatcher (Institutional Planning, Research and Assistant), and Dr. Ruth Kane (Chair).

The closing session on May 23, 2013, was attended by twelve (12) people and included Dr. Ruth Kane, Dr. Deanna Mercer, Dr. Rita Mitchell, Raymond Rose, Dr. Darla Smith, Jo Ann Schatz, Dr. Rozena McCabe, Dr. Eric Budd, Dr. Vicki Lott, Dr. Jan Seiter, Dora Dubra, and Dr. Larry L. Earvin President and CEO Huston-Tillotson University).

# COMPONENT I: Governance of Educator Preparation Programs- Texas Administrative Code (TAC) §228.20

# FINDINGS:

Program support was indicated by the governing body of Huston-Tillotson University educator preparation program per TAC §228.20(c) as evidenced by the participation and cooperation of Department Chair, Dr. Ruth Kane, Darla Smith, and Deanna Mercer in various stages and steps of the compliance audit. Additionally, the facilities and resources were adequate for the traditional undergraduate degrees offered within the Huston-Tillotson University Department of Educator Preparation.

The advisory committee consists of eleven (11) members. Six (6) members represented public/private schools, three (3) members represented higher education, one (1) member represented community/business interests, and one member was from an Education Service Center. Huston-Tillotson University educator preparation program met TAC §228.20(b) requirements for advisory committee composition.

The first meeting during the 2012-2013 academic year was held on November 7, 2012. Four (4) members attended this meeting. The agenda reflected that advisory committee training was provided utilizing the Statewide Advisory Committee training module with certificates of

attendance issued to members. The advisory committee membership also began addressing all required TAC §228.20 items. Agendas, minutes, and attendee records were available for review. The second meeting of the 2012-2013 academic year was held on March 7, 2013. Eleven (11) members attended this meeting. The agenda reflected that the advisory committee membership continued addressing the TAC §228.20 required agenda items. Agendas, minutes, and attendee records were available for review. An additional meeting is scheduled for June 5, 2013, for the 2012-2013 school year. Meetings for the 2013-2014 school year were not yet scheduled. Fifty-five percent (55%) of the advisory committee members indicated that they met two times per academic year. The program met the requirements for conducting a minimum of two advisory committee meetings per academic year for the 2012-2013 academic year as required by TAC §228.20(b).

Evidence that the advisory committee members understood their roles and responsibilities per TAC §228.20(b) was verified by certificates confirming their participation in state-wide advisory committee training, by an advisory committee handbook, by a letter of invitation to participate on the advisory committee with roles and responsibilities outlined, and by clearly defined bylaws for the current (2012-2013) academic year.

Evidence that advisory committee members assisted in the design, delivery, evaluation, and major policy decisions of the educator preparation program was provided in the minutes and agenda topics for the current (2012-2013) academic year. Through responses on their questionnaires, the advisory committee members verified their participation in the design, delivery, major policy decisions and evaluation. The results follow:

Yes - 100%

Yes - 100%

Yes - 75%

Yes - 100%

No-25%

- Evaluating data/improvement plans
- Field-based Experiences
- Major Policy Decisions of the EPP
- Overall Program Evaluation

Based on the evidence presented, Huston-Tillotson University is in compliance with Texas Administrative Code §228.20 – Governance of Educator Preparation Programs.

# COMPONENT II: ADMISSION CRITERIA - Texas Administrative Code (TAC) §227.10

# FINDINGS:

According to the University website, catalogs, and handbooks, to enter the teacher certification program, a candidate must have a 2.5 GPA or at least a 2.5 in last 60 hours [TAC §227.10(a)(3)(A)]; a passing score on the COMPASS, THEA, ACCUPLACER, ASSET, ACT (within last 5 years), or SAT (within last 5 years) [TAC §227.10(c)]; twelve (12) semester credit hours in a content field [TAC 227.10(a)(3)(C)]; show mastery of basic skills [TAC §227.10(a)(4)]; exhibit adequate oral communication skills[TAC 227.10(a)(5); submit an application [TAC §227.10(a)(6)]; participate in an interview [TAC §227.10(a)(6)]; and meet any other requirements the program determines [TAC §227.10(a)(7)].

Out-of-country applicants whose first language is not English must demonstrate competence in the English language by submission of an official minimum score of 26 on the Oral section on the computer-based Test of English as a Foreign Language (TOEFL). In addition, the applicant must have his/her transcripts from an out-of-country non-English speaking university evaluated by an approved evaluation service [TAC §227.10(e)]. Currently, HT traditional undergraduate EPP does not have any out-of-country students, but has a policy in place in case the need arises.

In a review of twenty candidates' records, it was found that new procedures have been implemented to organize a candidate's' entrance into the program. Applications, interviews, written assessments, letters of recommendation, transcripts, and THEA, Accuplacer, Asset or TSI scores were present as verification of adherence to admission criteria.

It was noted that no candidates were admitted with a grade point average of less than 2.5. [TAC §227.10(3)(b)]

The self-report submitted by Huston-Tillotson University EPP stated that recruitment was conducted through the website, catalogue, and brochures. [TAC 227.10(a)(7)].

Based on the evidence presented, Huston-Tillotson University is in compliance with TAC §227.10 – Admission Criteria.

# COMPONENT III: CURRICULUM - Texas Administrative Code (TAC) §228.30

#### **FINDINGS:**

Huston-Tillotson University is approved to offer teacher certification in nineteen (19) certification fields and three (3) supplemental certifications which attach to the base certificate. For the purpose of this compliance audit, the Generalist EC-6 certificate was selected for in-depth review.

It was documented in the self-report that the qualifications necessary to be selected as a course instructor included: possess an advanced degree, meet Southern Association of Colleges and Schools criteria, possess a Texas Teacher Certificate in corresponding content and grade levels, and have more than five years teaching experience in the content at the specific grade level. All instructors had the appropriate background and/or experience to provide instruction in the Generalist EC-6 certification area.

In reviewing the Generalist EC-6 curriculum, it was found that the educator standards were the curricular basis for instruction as required by TAC §228.30(a). It was also noted that the Generalist EC-6 curriculum provided evidence that it addressed the relevant Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills (TEKS) as required by TAC §228.30(a).

The seventeen (17) subject matter topics were included in the coursework as prescribed by TAC §228.30(b) as follows:

 The specified requirements for reading instruction [TAC §228.30(b)(1)]adopted by the SBEC for each certificate were verified through evidence found in the syllabi of RDNG3311, RDNG3321, and RDNG4322;

- Instruction in child development was verified in the syllabi of EDUC2302, EDUC3365, RDNG3311, SEDL2301 [TAC §228.30(b)(3)];
- Instruction in student motivation was verified in the syllabi of EDUC1301, EDUC2302, EDUC2303, EDUC2305, EDUC3303, EDUC3311, EDUC3363, EDUC3365, EDUC4306, EDUC 4307, EDOC4907, EDNG3311, RDNG3321, RDNG4322, SEDL2301 [TAC §228.30(b)(4)];
- Instruction in learning theories was verified in the syllabi of EDUC1301, EDUC2302, EDUC2303, EDUC3303, EDUC3365, EDUC4307, RDNG 3311 [TAC §228.30(b)(5)];
- Awareness of TEKS organization, structure, and skills was verified in the syllabi of EDUC2302, EDUC3303, EDUC3365, EDUC4307, RDNG 3311, RDNG3321, RDNG4322 [TAC §228.30(b)(6)];
- Utilization of TEKS in the content areas was verified in the syllabi of EDUC2302, EDUC3303, EDUC3365, EDUC4307, RDNG3311. RDNG3321, RDNG4322 [TAC §228.30(b)(7)];
- The state assessment of students (STAAR) awareness was verified in the syllabi of EDUC3365, EDUC4306, RDNG3311 RDNG3321, RDNG 4322 [TAC §228.28(b)(8)];
- Curriculum development and lesson planning instruction were verified in the syllabi of EDUC2302,EDUC 3303, EDUC4307, EDOC4907, RDNG3311, RDNG3321, RDNG4322 [TAC §228.30(b)(9)];
- Classroom assessment and diagnosing learning needs instruction were verified in the syllabi of EDUC3303, EDUC3365, EDUC4306, EDUC4307, RDNG3311, RDNG3321, RDNG4322, SEDL2301, EDUC3303, EDUC3365, EDUC4306, EDUC4307, RDNG3311, RDNG3321, RDNG 4322, SEDL2301 [TAC §228.30(b)(10)];
- Classroom management / developing a positive learning environment was verified in the syllabi of EDUC1301, EDUC3303, EDUC4306, EDUC4307, EDOC4907, SEDL2301 [TAC §228.30(b)(11)];
- Instruction in the needs of special populations students was verified in the syllabi of EDUC2305, SEDL2301, READING: RDNG3311, RNDG3321, RNDG4322 [TAC §228.30(b)(12)];
- Parent conferences and communication skills were verified in the syllabi of EDUC1301, EDUC2302, EDUC3303, EDUC4306, EDUC4307, RNDG4322 [TAC §228.30(b)(13)];
- Instructional technology was verified in the syllabi of EDUC1301, EDUC2302, EDUC3303,EDUC 3365, EDUC4306, EDUC4307, RDNG3311, RDNG3321, RDNG4322, SEDL2301[TAC §228.30(b)(14)];
- Pedagogy / instructional strategies was verified in the syllabi ofEDUC2302, EDUC3303, EDUC3365, EDUC4307, EDOC4907, RDNG3311 [TAC §228.30(b)(15)]; and
- Differentiated instruction was verified in the syllabi of EDUC3303, EDUC3365, EDUC4307, RDNG3311, RDNG4322, SEDL2301 [TAC §228.30(b)(16)].

Six hours of test preparation were provided for candidates prior to TExES testing as per TAC §228.30(b)(17) and TAC §228.35(a)(3)(C). Evidence was reflected in alignment charts and sign-in sheets with dates.

Student teachers, clinical teachers, and interns were asked to respond to a series of questions prepared by TEA in order to verify aspects of the curriculum and its delivery and its effectiveness.

Based on the responses to the questionnaires, the following are recommended areas to review for improvement:

- o Teacher's Responsibilities for administering TAKS/STAAR
- Theories of How People Learn
- o Standards & Teaching Strategies for Students Designated as GT
- o Conducting Parent Conferences
- Standards & Teaching Strategies for Students with Limited English Proficiency

Based on evidence presented, Huston-Tillotson University is in compliance with Texas Administrative Code Section §228.30 – Educator Preparation Curriculum.

# COMPONENT IV: Preparation Program Coursework and/or Training (TAC) §228.35

# FINDINGS:

Currently, the Huston-Tillotson University Educator Preparation Program is a traditional program delivered in a face-to-face manner. The total program consists of 2801 clock hours for elementary certification as evidenced by degree plans, program courses and module schedules. This met the requirements set forth in TAC §228.35(a)(3).

Thirty (30) clock hours of field-based experience was verified prior to student teaching per TAC §228.35(d). Fifteen (15) hours of field-based experience may be provided by use of electronic transmission, or other video or technology-based method per TAC 228.35(a)(3)(A), but was not utilized in the program.

Per TAC §228.35(a)(6), the program may allow candidates to substitute prior ongoing experience and/or professional training for part of the educator preparation requirements such as the thirty (30) hours of field-based experiences. However, previous experience cannot replace internship, student teaching, or clinical teaching. Huston-Tillotson University had policies that were available for such an accommodation; however, no student records reflected this allowance.

Eighty (80) hours of coursework prior to student teaching were verified by reviewing student folders, degree plans, and professional development series as required by TAC §228.35(a).

Student teaching [TAC 228.35(d)(2)(A)] was conducted for a minimum of twelve (12) weeks. Evidence was verified in review of program requirements, student teaching placement start and end dates, degree plans, and other records of a full semester of student teaching.

Evidence that student teaching took place in an actual school setting rather than a distance learning lab or virtual school setting as prohibited by TAC §228.35(d)(2)(C)(ii) was present in the student records and observations logs.

According to TAC §228.35(e), Huston-Tillotson University is responsible for providing mentor or cooperating teacher training that is scientifically –based or verify that training has been provided by a school district or education service center. Evidence existed with original signature on documents verifying training received, sign in sheets with original signatures, certificate of completion, and training agendas.

TAC §228.35(f) states that supervision of each candidate shall be conducted with the structured guidance and regular ongoing support of an experienced educator who has been trained as a field supervisor. Evidence existed that field supervisors received adequate training as verified by training logs.

Verification of initial contact by the field supervisor within the first three weeks of the assignment as required by TAC §228.35(f) was documented with supporting sign-in logs.

A total of three observations [TAC §228.35(f)(4)] must be conducted during the student teaching assignment and must be at least 45 minutes in duration [TAC §228.35(f)]. TAC §228.35(f) also states that the first observation must be conducted within the first six weeks of student teaching. Evidence found in the student folders confirmed that students were observed more than three times for 45 minutes on the prescribed schedule.

Furthermore, TAC §228.35(f) requires that the field supervisors document observed instructional practices and provide written feedback through an interactive conference with the candidates. Evidence in the student folder recorded the date of the observation and interactive conference.

It is also the responsibility of Huston-Tillotson University to provide a copy of the written feedback to the candidate's campus administrator as required by TAC §228.35(f). Huston-Tillotson copied the observations on-site and delivered them to the administrator before leaving the campus the day of the observation. A signature in the observation logs was evidence of compliance.

Additional informal observations and coaching were documented by the program as specified in TAC §228.35(f).

Based on evidence presented, Huston-Tillotson University is in compliance with Texas Administrative Code Section §228.35 – Program Delivery and On-Going Support.

COMPONENT V: Assessment and Evaluation of Candidates for Certification and Program Improvement – Texas Administrative Code (TAC) §228.40

# FINDINGS:

Huston-Tillotson University utilized a candidate assessment and benchmarking process as prescribed by TAC §228.40(a). The evidence presented for review included the degree plan for

the Generalist EC-6 certification. Structured assessments were reflected in individual candidate records (i.e. grades) showing progression through the program and assessments were detailed in course syllabi outlining the specific assessments used throughout the program. The evidence presented for review met the requirements of TAC §228.40(a).

Readiness for testing [TAC §228.40(b)] was verified by review of individual candidate records. The date of test approval for PPR testing was documented in reviewed candidates' folders. Additional documentation consisted of benchmark activities, timelines, detailed criterion to qualify for testing, and practice exams. According to TAC §228.40(b), the program shall not grant test approval for the pedagogy and professional responsibilities test until the candidate has met all the requirements for admission to the program and has been fully accepted into the educator preparation program. The program met the requirements of TAC §228.40(b).

Evaluation of the program's design and delivery of the curriculum should be continuous per TAC §228.40(c). Information such as performance data, scientifically-based research practices, and the results of internal and external assessments should be included in the evaluation process. Evidence existed that HT used student surveys among other data sources and presented the evaluative information to the advisory committee s.

According to TAC §228.40(d), the program retained documents that evidenced a candidate's eligibility for admission to the program and completion of all program requirements for a period of five years after the candidate completed the program. The presence of records for the past five years in both electronic and paper format were available for review during the on-site portion of the audit. The records were securely stored in the educator preparation services offices located at 900 Chicon Street, Austin, TX 78702 in locked file cabinets in secure rooms. The retention of records met the requirements of TAC §228.40(d).

Based on evidence presented, Huston-Tillotson University is in compliance with Texas Administrative Code §228.40 – Assessment and Evaluation of Candidates for Certification and Program Improvement.

# COMPONENT VI : Professional Conduct (TAC) §228.50

TAC §228.50(a) states that during the period of preparation, the educator preparation entity shall ensure that the individuals preparing candidates and the candidates themselves demonstrate adherence to Chapter 247 (relating to Educators' Code of Ethics). Huston-Tillotson University EPP ensured that the individuals preparing candidates demonstrate adherence to TAC §228.50 and TAC §247.2 by requiring each individual to present a signed statement of reading, understanding, and abiding by the Code of Ethics. Signed acknowledgements were available. This met the requirements of TAC §228.50.

Huston-Tillotson University EPP ensured that the candidates themselves demonstrated adherence to TAC §228.50 and TAC §247.2 by requiring a signed acknowledgement of reading and understanding the Educators' Code of Ethics. These acknowledgments were found in each of the twenty (20) student records reviewed. The online student handbook also contained a detailed Code of Ethics. Through a review of the alignment charts, training in multiple courses indicated that Huston-Tillotson University provided instruction in the Code of Ethics as one of the seventeen (17) curriculum topics. The teaching of the Code of Ethics and standard practices for Texas Educators met the requirements of TAC §228.30(b)(2).

Based on evidence presented, Huston-Tillotson University is in compliance with Texas Administrative Code §228.50 – Professional Conduct.

#### Texas Administrative Code §229 Current Accreditation Status

The Huston-Tillotson University Educator Preparation Program is currently rated "Accredited". The results of the certification exams were taken directly from the program's Educator Certification Online System (ECOS) for the completion years listed in the table below:

#### Standard I: Results of Certification Exams

Pass Rate Performance:	2009-2010	2010-2011	2011-2012
	70% Standard	75% Standard	80% Pass Rate
Overall:	95%	91%	90%

# **PROGRAM RECOMMENDATIONS**

Program Compliance Recommendations are based on the findings of the Texas Education Agency compliance audit. If the program is out of compliance with any component, please consult the Texas Administrative Code (TAC) and correct the issue IMMEDIATELY. Failure to comply with TAC rules governing educator preparation programs may result in action by the State Board for Educator Certification (SBEC) per TAC 229 beginning in 2010.

General Recommendations are suggestions for program improvement only.

**PROGRAM COMPLIANCE RECOMMENDATIONS:** In order to meet requirements of all Texas Administrative Code rule governing educator preparation programs, the following recommendations are made:

The program was in compliance in all areas.

#### **OTHER PROGRAM RECOMMENDATIONS:**

• Continue to follow the State Board for Educator Certification (SBEC) and the State Board of Education (SBOE) meetings and/or review the minutes to ensure that the program staff is knowledgeable about current Texas Administrative Code;

- Participate in Annual Deans/Directors Meetings to ensure that the program director is knowledgeable about current Texas Administrative Code and future changes to Texas Administrative Code (Webinar Series);
- Continue to participate in webinars provided by the Division of Educator Certification & Standards to ensure that the program staff is knowledgeable about current requirements and changes in Texas Administrative Code;
- Continue to maintain communication with the program specialist assigned to the program for the purpose of asking questions about current requirements in TAC for Governance; Admissions; Curriculum; Program Delivery & On-Going Support; and Program Evaluation (TAC § 227-229).
- Align the verbiage of the program to that of current Texas Administrative Code. For example: Applicant / Candidate / Field Supervisor / Internship / Clinical Teacher
- Ensure that the Dean/Director/Program Staff utilizes the EPP Staff Information page <u>http://www.tea.state.tx.us/eppinfo.aspx</u> to access pertinent information that EPP's frequently request.
- Ensure that TEA staff has the most current & up-to-date contact information by sending an email to <u>victoria.ellis@tea.state.tx.us</u> as well as notifying the program specialist assigned.
- Utilize the TEA approved Educator Ethics training program which the program already has access to. <u>www.ethicstexas.com</u> follow updates at <u>www.tea.state.tx.us/ethics</u>