



Technical Compliance Audit Report 2014-2015 Paul Quinn College

According to Texas Administrative Code (TAC) §228.10(c), "An entity approved by the SBEC under this chapter...shall be reviewed at least once every five years under procedures approved by the Texas Education Agency (TEA) staff; however, a review may be conducted at any time at the discretion of the TEA staff." Per TAC §228.1(c), "All educator preparation programs are subject to the same standards of accountability, as required under Chapter 229 of this title." The Texas Education Agency administers Texas Administrative Code required by the Texas legislature for the regulation of all educator preparation programs in the state. Please see the complete Texas Administrative Code at www.tea.state.tx.us for details.

Contact Information: Dr. Kizuwanda Grant

County/District Number: 161504

SBEC Approval Date: 1990

Texas Education Agency Education Preparation Program Manager, Sandra Jo Nix, and Program Specialist, Mixon Henry, conducted a technical compliance audit of Paul Quinn College, 3837 Simpson Stuart Road, Dallas, TX 75241, on December 16-18, 2014, as required by Texas Administrative Code (TAC) §229. The following are the findings of the audit.

Scope of the Compliance Audit:

The scope of this audit is restricted solely to verifying compliance with Texas Administrative Code §227, §228, §229, and §230.

Data Analysis:

Information concerning compliance with TAC governing educator preparation programs was collected by various qualitative means. A self-report was submitted to TEA on December 2, 2014. An onsite review of documents, student records, course materials, and curriculum correlations charts provided evidence regarding compliance. In addition, TEA sent electronic questionnaires to Paul Quinn College stakeholders. Five (5) out of eight (8) advisory committee members responded; two (2) out of twenty-three (23) educator candidates, one (1) out of three (3) principals, and three (3) out of three (3) cooperating teachers/mentors responded. Qualitative methods of content analysis, cross-referencing, and triangulation of the data were used to evaluate the evidence. Evidence of compliance was measured using a rubric aligned to Texas Administrative Code.

Findings, Compliance Issues, and Recommendations:

Findings indicate evidence that was collected during the audit process. Findings will identify any areas that the program is not meeting Texas Administrative Code (TAC). If the program is NOT in compliance with any identified component on the rubric, the program should consult the Texas Administrative Code and correct the issue IMMEDIATELY. An action plan will be drafted during the visit that identifies compliance issues to be addressed and a timeline for completion. Program recommendations are suggestions for general program improvement and no follow up is required.

Opening and Closing Session:

The opening session on December 16, 2014, was attended by Dr. Kizuwanda Grant and Ms. Rosa Johnson. During the opening session, Dr. Grant presented an overview of the Paul Quinn College Teacher Preparation Program.

The closing session was held on December 18, 2014, and was attended by the same individuals. During the closing session an action plan was developed to guide implementation of compliance issues and general recommendations.

COMPONENT I: COMMITMENT AND COLLABORATION - Texas Administrative Code (TAC) §228.20

FINDINGS:

- 1) The advisory committee currently consists of 13 members. Seven (7) member of the advisory committee are from local school districts, four (4) member represent institutions of higher education, and one member represents business and community. Paul Quinn College meets TAC §228.20(b) minimum requirements for advisory committee composition.
- 2) Advisory committee meetings were held on May 22, 2014 and on June 5, 2014 and October 7, 2014. The next advisory committee meeting is scheduled for February 10, 2015. Agendas, minutes, and attendee records were available as evidence of compliance. The next advisory committee meetings is yet to be scheduled [TAC §228.20(b)].
- 3) According to TAC 228.20(b), the advisory committee shall assist in the design, delivery, evaluation, and major policy decisions of the educator preparation program. Evidence was available in the minutes that these areas were discussed. However, it was felt that the advisory committee needed to be more involved with program evaluation and that the minutes need to reflect the interaction among members and staff.

Compliance Issues: None

Recommendations:

- 1) Increase number of advisory committee members to include human resource directors, superintendents, cooperating teachers/mentors, former and current candidates in order to secure a broader spectrum of ideas and views.
- 2) Prepare an advisory handbook for those who cannot attend the face-to-face training.

- 3) Explore the use of technology such as webinars, WebEx, conference calls, etc. to conduct advisory committee meetings in order to increase participation.
- 4) Take detailed minutes of the meeting to reflect interactive discussions among members.
- 5) Use the template for advisory committee meetings to ensure all required areas are covered during the advisory committee meetings.

Based on the evidence presented, Paul Quinn College is in compliance with Texas Administrative Code §228.20 – Governance of Educator Preparation Programs.

COMPONENT II: ADMISSION CRITERIA - Texas Administrative Code (TAC) §227.10

FINDINGS:

- 1.) According to information found on the Paul Quinn College website and in the self-report, all candidates meet TAC requirements for admission to an alternative certification program [TAC §227.10(a)(7)].
- 2.) Record keeping was insufficient. Evidence of the following could not be located in the candidates' records: completed application and interview with scored rubric. §228.40(d)].
- 3.) Paul Quinn College currently does not have candidates from out-of-country but has procedures in place for transcript evaluation and TOEFL examination with a speaking score of 26 if needed [TAC §227.10(e)]. Most of the missing information was found in older candidate records. However, with the addition of Ms. Johnson as the Program Director, there was a marked improvement of documentation but still needed to be refined. Use the candidate record organization recommended during the audit.
- 4.) The program offers both a traditional undergraduate and post-baccalaureate route to certification. All post-baccalaureate candidates have at least a bachelor's degree. All entering candidates must have a minimum of 2.75 grade point average (GPA) overall or in the last 60 clock hours. In addition, the candidates must meet the TAC required content hours for admission [TAC §227.10(a)(3)(B)]. There were some inconsistencies in the information provided on the website concerning the GPA. In some places, the entry GPA was listed as 2.5 and in some places 2.75. It is recommended that all admission information be reviewed for consistency and accuracy.
- 5.) The program currently accepts the Pre-Admission Content Test (PACT) but will also accept applicants without it. The program is reviewing the addition of the PACT test as a mandatory admission criteria [TAC §227.10(a)(C)].
- 6.) The program maintains candidate records for five years in a secure environment.

Compliance Issues to be addressed:

§227.10(a)(6) Applications.... Require an application to the teacher education program from each candidate and retain it in the candidate's records beginning January 1, 2015.

§227.10(a)(6) ...interview or other screening instruments used to determine candidate's appropriateness for certification sought. Require an interview from each candidate and place the scoring rubric in the candidate's records beginning January 1, 2015.

Recommendations:

- Align terminology to that in TAC (i.e. field supervisor, cooperating teacher, mentor, etc.).
- Review all of the program's approved certification fields and identify and remove those the program cannot adequately support. Send a letter via email to TEA on Paul Quinn College letterhead signed by the legal authority requesting to remove the areas from their approved list.
- Add an oral reading sample to the interview process. Ask the candidates to answer questions about what they have read.
- Have candidates sign an acknowledgement which assures the program that the candidate has read, understood, and will abide by the Texas Educator's Code of Ethics. Place a copy of the Code of Ethics in each candidate's record. Detailed coverage of the Texas Code of Ethics will continue to be a module in the coursework.

Based on the evidence presented, Paul Quinn College is not in compliance with TAC §227.10 - Admission Criteria.

COMPONENT III: CURRICULUM - Texas Administrative Code (TAC) §228.30

FINDINGS:

- 1) The Paul Quinn College syllabi revealed inconsistencies in course goals, objectives, and the schedule of work to be completed. It was felt that the curriculum was disjointed and unorganized. Therefore, evidence was not available that all required coursework was covered. All Pedagogy and Professional Responsibility coursework should correlate with the new teacher standards with the educator standards for pedagogy and professional responsibilities by TAC §228.30(a).
- 2) Paul Quinn College identified several adjunct professors who create, update, present and facilitate coursework. Their vitas were presented for review and it was verified that all the instructors have teaching credentials.
- 3) Paul Quinn College is part of a consortium with other historically black colleges and utilizes some online programs offered online by other institutions. However, it was noted that there were severe technology issues that caused the delivery of these courses to be unreliable.
- 4) Reading content instruction was evident for elementary certification. It was indicated that Reading in the Content Area would be added when the secondary program is re-initiated again.

- 5) The reviewed curriculum lacked depth and rigor in content pedagogy, including minimal reference to TEKS as required by TAC §228.30(a).
- 6) Assessments were not evaluating the educator certification standards [TAC 228.40(a)].
- 7) Interactive practice for candidates was insufficient to allow for skill attainment [TAC 228.40(a)].

Compliance Issues to be addressed:

- As required by TAC 228.40(a), develop assessments that test mastery of educator certification standards utilizing the upper level of Bloom's Taxonomy.
- Re-evaluate the coursework to ensure coverage of the new teacher standards, educator standards, and TEKS §228.30(a).
- The curriculum for each educator preparation program shall rely on scientifically based research to ensure teacher effectiveness and align to the TEKS [§228.30(b)].
- Coursework and training should be sustained, rigorous, interactive, student-focused, and performance-based. Include more opportunities to demonstrate "skills" required for each specific certification area (i.e., lesson planning, differentiation, etc.).

Recommendations:

- Flip the teacher education courses to require the knowledge portion to be gained by the candidates outside of the required class period and use the in-class portion to focus on the skill attainment and application portion of becoming the practiced teacher.
- Consider fusing some of the out-of-department core content area courses with the teacher education courses (i.e. art, music, drama, etc.) allowing for the reduction of the number of required education courses or redirection of the course content.
- Redesign the EC-6 degree plan.
- Refrain from giving point or counting a percentage of the grade for attendance and participation.
- Ensure assessments evaluate the acquisition of the knowledge and application of skills.
- Use TExES formatted questions in assessments in order for candidates to become familiar with the vocabulary, question format, and reasoning associated with answering the questions successfully.

Based on evidence presented, Paul Quinn College is not in compliance with Texas Administrative Code Section §228.30.

COMPONENT IV: PROGRAM DELIVERY AND ONGOING SUPPORT - Texas Administrative Code (TAC) §228.35

FINDINGS:

- 1) Currently, the Paul Quinn College's initial teacher preparation program is delivered in a face-to-face format with some courses from the consortium being presented online. The program course hours are 525.
- 2) There was evidence of 30 clock hours of field-based observations prior to internship. Observation logs or other evidence of completion of the 30 clock hours were found in some candidates' records. However, it did not appear that the field based observations were focused nor occurring in a variety of schools, grade levels, or with diverse student populations. There was no differentiation between the 15 hours of candidate interaction with students and the observation only hours.
- 3) Most candidates complete student teaching which is 12 consecutive weeks. It was shared that a new charter school will be opening on the campus of Paul Quinn College in the fall and that the teacher education students will be heavily involved in supporting student success. It was also recommended that freshman students interested in teaching have a one hour credit course which allows them to become immediately involved in the classroom.
- 4) According to TAC §228.35(e), Paul Quinn College is responsible for providing cooperating teacher/mentor training that is scientifically-based or verify that training has been provided by a school district or education service center. During the audit, the program modified the student teaching handbook to include the field supervisors and cooperating teachers and mentors. The handbook was sent electronically to all cooperating teachers/mentors and verified by delivery receipts.
- 5) TAC §228.35(f) states that supervision of each candidate shall be conducted with the structured guidance and regular ongoing support of an experienced educator who has been trained as a field supervisor and is currently certified as an educator. Currently there is only one field supervisor and Ms. Johnson meets the requirements for a field supervisor. Notes, email, and records of discussions between Ms. Johnson and Dr. Grant provided evidence of collaboration and training.
- 6) Evidence of two observations were located in the candidates' records. Three observations are required by TAC §228.35(f). Evidence of additional informal observations and coaching was available in the field supervisor's logs.

Compliance Issues to be addressed:

1. Require 30 hours of field-based observations with fifteen hours of interaction with public or private school students differentiated that are conducted in a variety of settings and grades levels with diverse student populations. Document the observations in each candidate's records [TAC §228.35(d)].

2. Require that 15 of the 30 clock hours of field-based observations are in direct student contact.
3. For clinical/student teaching and internships, the program shall provide a minimum of three observations during the term of the practicum [TAC 228.25(f)]

Recommendations:

- Consider implementing a focused field-based observation tool;
- Encourage meaningful suggestions for improving the candidate's teaching skills on the observation form. Always ask the candidate how the field supervisor can support them.

Based on evidence presented, Paul Quinn College is not in compliance with Texas Administrative Code Section §228.35 – Program Delivery and On-Going Support.

COMPONENT V: PROGRAM EVALUATION – Texas Administrative Code (TAC) §228.40

FINDINGS:

- 1) The program has identified a set of benchmarks that each candidate must attain including benchmarks in order to be recommended for testing. However, these benchmarks had not been completed individually for each candidate in the teacher education program. During the audit, a benchmark record was completed for each candidate and placed in his/her candidate record.
- 2) Program evaluation has been on-going as the program has been rebuilt, but collecting formal evaluative data has not been a priority up to this point. The program should expand evaluative data collection to include course effectiveness surveys by candidates, surveys from mentors, and principals and utilize TEA data as well as data available from Educational Testing Systems (ETS).
- 3) Include the advisory committee in evaluation efforts.

Compliance issues to be addressed:

- None

Recommendations:

- Consider conducting course and other surveys to secure feedback on individual course effectiveness, instructor effectiveness and perceptions from candidates.
- Consider conducting surveys of former candidates (1-3 years into teaching career), mentor teachers, and principals to determine overall program effectiveness.

Based on evidence presented, Paul Quinn College in compliance with Texas Administrative Code §228.40 – Assessment and Evaluation of Candidates of Candidates for Certification and Program Improvement.

COMPONENT VI: Professional Conduct (TAC) §228.50

Findings:

TAC §228.50(a) states that during the period of preparation, the educator preparation entity shall ensure that the individuals preparing candidates and the candidates themselves demonstrate adherence to Chapter 247 of this title (relating to Educators' Code of Ethics).

1. Candidates were provided instruction in the Texas Educators' Code of Ethics in the student handbook as well as through their coursework. Candidates also sign an ethics form prior to admission.
2. Dr. Grant and Ms. Johnson provided evidence of acknowledging the Texas Educator's Code of Ethics contents and requirements.

Based on evidence presented, Paul Quinn College is in compliance with Texas Administrative Code §228.50(a) regarding Professional Conduct.