The State Board of Education Committee of the Full Board met at 9:08 a.m. on Tuesday, November 13, 2018, in the State Board of Education Room, #1-104, of the William B. Travis Building, 1701 N. Congress Avenue, Austin, Texas. Attendance was noted as follows:

Present: Donna Bahorich, chair; Lawrence A. Allen, Jr.; Erika Beltran; David Bradley; Barbara Cargill; Ruben Cortez, Jr.; Keven Ellis; Pat Hardy; Tom Maynard; Sue Melton-Malone; Geraldine “Tincy” Miller; Georgina C. Pérez; Marisa B. Perez-Diaz; Marty Rowley, vice chair

Public Testimony

The Committee of the Full Board heard public testimony on agenda item #1. Information regarding the individuals who presented public testimony is included in the discussion of that item.

ACTION ITEM

1. Proposed Revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 113, Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for Social Studies, and Proposed Repeal of 19 TAC Chapter 118, Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for Economics with Emphasis on the Free Enterprise System and Its Benefits
   (Second Reading and Final Adoption)
   (Board agenda page I-1)
   [Official agenda item # 3]

   NAME: Debby McCray
   AFFILIATION: Self

   NAME: Erin Miller
   AFFILIATION: Self

   NAME: Tom Lucas
   AFFILIATION: Women's Airforce Service Pilots

   NAME: Barry Brake
   AFFILIATION: Self

   NAME: Lynn D. Segall
   AFFILIATION: Self

   NAME: Nicole Hudgens
   AFFILIATION: Texas Values

   NAME: Ann Hobing
   AFFILIATION: National WASP WWII Museum at Avenger Field

   NAME: Kara Lehnert
   AFFILIATION: Self
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>AFFILIATION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Annisa McCollom</td>
<td>Self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Amy Jo Baker</td>
<td>Self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sandra Alfonsi</td>
<td>Truth in Textbooks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mary Castle</td>
<td>Texas Values</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gabrielle Caldwell</td>
<td>Self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robbie Caldwell</td>
<td>Deaf Blind Multi-handicapped Association of Texas (DBMAT)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rayford Brown</td>
<td>Self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Karis Heise</td>
<td>Self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paul Daley</td>
<td>Self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alex McDonald</td>
<td>Texas Coalition for Human Rights</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Snehal Shingavi</td>
<td>Self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hana Masri</td>
<td>Self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Geneva Might</td>
<td>Self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shifa Bhatti</td>
<td>Self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Haithem El-Zabri</td>
<td>Self</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jonathan Richie</td>
<td>Wall Builders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lisa Flores</td>
<td>Self</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
NAME: Jane O'Brien
AFFILIATION: Self

NAME: Charles Kaufman
AFFILIATION: Shalom Austin, Jewish Community Relations Council, Jewish Federations, B'nai B'rith International

NAME: Roy White
AFFILIATION: Truth in Textbooks

NAME: Jan Barstow
AFFILIATION: Self

NAME: Pat Fry
AFFILIATION: Self

NAME: Linda Litzinger
AFFILIATION: Texans for Special Education Reform

NAME: Sobia Siddiqui
AFFILIATION: Council on American-Islamic Relations (CAIR) Houston

NAME: Gabriel Rivas
AFFILIATION: Self

**MOTION:** It was moved by Ms. Perez-Diaz and seconded by Mr. Maynard to recommend that the State Board of Education approve for second reading and final adoption proposed revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 113, Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for Social Studies, Subchapter A, Elementary, Subchapter B, Middle School, Subchapter C, High School, and Subchapter D, Other Social Studies Courses, and proposed repeal of 19 TAC Chapter 118, Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for Economics with Emphasis on the Free Enterprise System and Its Benefits, Subchapter A, High School, and Subchapter B, Other Economics Courses, with an effective date of August 26, 2019.

**MOTION AND VOTE:** It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone, seconded by Mr. Maynard, and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.11(b)(3)(C) to read as follows:

"identify and use explore geographic tools that aid in determining location, including maps and globes."

**MOTION AND VOTE:** It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.11(b)(2) to read as follows:

"The student understands how historical figures helped shape the state and nation. The student is expected to identify contributions of historical figures, including Stephen F. Austin, George Washington, and Christopher Columbus, and José Antonio Navarro, who helped to shape the state and nation. "

COFB–11/13/2018
MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.11(b)(13)(A) and §113.12(b)(17)(A) to read as follows:

"gather information about a topic using a variety of valid oral and visual sources such as interviews, music, pictures, symbols, and artifacts with adult assistance;"

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.12(b)(13) to read as follows:

"Citizenship. The student understands important symbols, customs, and celebrations that represent American beliefs and principles that contribute to our national identity."

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education strike §113.12(b)(16) and amend §113.12(b)(15) to read as follows:

"Science, technology, and society. The student identifies individuals who created or invented new technology and understands how technology affects daily life, past and present."

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education add new §113.12(b)(15)(C) to read as follows:

"identify the contributions of scientists and inventors such as Alexander Graham Bell, Thomas Edison, and Garrett Morgan."

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.13(b)(4)(A) to read as follows:

"gather information about a topic using a variety of valid oral and visual sources such as interviews, music, maps, pictures, symbols, and artifacts with; and"

The motion failed.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.13(b)(4)(A) to read as follows:

"identify major landforms and bodies of water, including each of the seven continents and each of the five oceans, on maps and globes; and"

The motion failed.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Dr. Ellis and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.13(b)(4)(A) to read as follows:

"identify major landforms and bodies of water, including each of the seven continents and each of the four oceans, on maps and globes; and"
MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone, seconded by Mrs. Cargill, and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.13(b)(7)(C) to read as follows:

"trace discuss the development of a product from a natural resource to a finished product."

MOTION: It was moved by Mr. Rowley to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.13(b)(10)(B) to read as follows:

"identify historical figures and other individuals who have exemplified good citizenship such as Paul Revere, Abigail Adams, World War II Women Airforce Service Pilots (WASP), and Sojourner Truth; and"

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education add Navajo Code Talkers to §113.13(b)(10)(B).

VOTE: A vote was taken on the original motion to recommend that the State Board of Education add World War II Women Airforce Service Pilots (WASP) to §113.13(b)(10)(B) as amended. The motion carried.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.13(b)(11) to read as follows:

"Citizenship. The student understands important symbols, identifies customs, symbols, and celebrations that represent American beliefs and principles that contribute to our national identity."

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education add new §113.13(b)(11)(D) to read as follows:

"identify how selected symbols, customs, and celebrations reflect an American love of individualism, inventiveness, and freedom."

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.13(b)(11)(B) to read as follows:

"sing, recite, or identify selected patriotic songs, including "The Star-Spangled Banner" and "America the Beautiful"; and"

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone, seconded by Mrs. Cargill, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.14(b)(1)(B) to read as follows:

"identify individuals, including Pierre-Charles L'Enfant, Benjamin Banneker, and Benjamin Franklin, who have helped to shape communities; and"

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.14(b)(9) to read as follows:

"Citizenship. The student understands characteristics of good citizenship as exemplified by historical and contemporary figures and organizations."
MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education strike §113.14(b)(10)(C) and add new §113.14(b)(9)(D) to read as follows:

"identify examples of nonprofit and/or civic organizations such as the Red Cross and explain how they serve the common good."

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone, seconded by Ms. Hardy, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education reinsert §113.14(b)(9)(A) to read as follows:

"identify characteristics of good citizenship, including truthfulness, justice, equality, respect for oneself and others, responsibility in daily life, and participation in government by educating oneself about the issues, respectfully holding public officials to their word, and voting;"

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone, seconded by Mrs. Cargill, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.14(b)(9)(B) to read as follows:

"identify figures such as Helen Keller and Clara Barton and Ruby Bridges who exemplify good citizenship; and"

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.14(b)(9)(B) to read as follows:

"identify and discuss individual acts of civic responsibility, including obeying laws, serving and improving the community, serving on a jury, and voting."

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.14(b)(12)(A) to reinsert Juliette Gordon Low. The motion failed.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.14(b)(12)(A) to reinsert Ellen Ochoa. The motion failed.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.14(b)(13)(A) to reinsert Phillis Wheatley. The motion failed.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Cortez to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.14(b)(3)(A) to read as follows:

"describe and explain variations in the physical environment, including climate, landforms, natural resources, and natural hazards;"

The motion failed.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.15(b)(15)(B) to read as follows:

"explain how individuals can participate voluntarily in civic affairs at state and local levels through activities such as respectfully holding public officials to their word, writing letters and participating in historic preservation and service projects"
MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Melton-Malone, seconded by Ms. Hardy, and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.16(b)(16) to read as follows:

"Citizenship. The student understands important symbols and customs celebrations, and landmarks that represent American beliefs and principles that contribute to our national identity."

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Cargill and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.16(b)(16)(A) to strike “important landmarks such as the White House, and Mount Rushmore” and to amend §113.16(b)(16)(D) to read as follows:

"explain the significance of the White House, the Statue of Liberty, and Mount Rushmore"

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Cortez to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.16(b)(4)(D) to strike states’ rights.

The motion failed with 5 members voting Aye and 9 members voting No as follows:

Aye:  Mr. Allen  Ms. Pérez
       Ms. Beltran  Ms. Perez-Diaz
       Mr. Cortez

No:  Mr. Bradley  Mrs. Melton-Malone
     Mrs. Cargill  Mr. Mercer
     Dr. Ellis  Mrs. Miller
     Ms. Hardy  Mr. Rowley
     Mr. Maynard

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Cortez to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.20(b)(8)(B) to strike states’ rights.

The motion failed with 5 members voting Aye and 9 members voting No as follows:

Aye:  Mr. Allen  Ms. Pérez
       Ms. Beltran  Ms. Perez-Diaz
       Mr. Cortez

No:  Mr. Bradley  Mrs. Melton-Malone
     Mrs. Cargill  Mr. Mercer
     Dr. Ellis  Mrs. Miller
     Ms. Hardy  Mr. Rowley
     Mr. Maynard

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Bradley, seconded by Mr. Mercer, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.20(b)(4)(B) to reinsert Wentworth Cheswell.
MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Mercer and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education add new §113.20(b)(3)(C) to read as follows:

"describe how religion and virtue contributed to the growth of representative government in the American colonies."

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy to recommend that the State Board of Education add new §113.20(b)(19)(C) to read as follows:

"explain the importance of personal responsibilities, including accepting responsibility for one's behavior and supporting one's family;"

The motion failed.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.20(b)(26)(A) to read as follows:

"identify examples of American art, music, and literature that reflect society in different eras such as the Hudson River School artists, “Battle Hymn of the Republic,” and transcendental literature; and"

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mrs. Cargill and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education add new §113.20(b)(29)(D) to read as follows:

"identify bias and points of view created by from the historical context surrounding an event which influenced the participants;"

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend proposed new §113.31(c)(4)(B) to change “compare” to “contrast”.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend proposed new §113.31(c)(5) to add “the U.S.” before free enterprise system.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend proposed new §113.31(c)(12)(D) to read as follows:

“describe the current role of the U.S. dollar in trade in the world market and analyze how that has changed over time in particular since departing from the gold standard in 1971, analyze the decline in the value of the U.S. dollar, including the abandonment of the gold standard.”

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.41(b)(8) to read as follows:

“Students identify and discuss how and whether the actions of U.S. citizens and the local, state, and federal governments have achieved, either met or failed to meet the ideals espoused in the founding documents.”

The committee asked staff to make conforming changes to all applicable grades and courses.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Rowley and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.41(c)(20)(A) to reinsert Brown v. Board of Education.
MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy to recommend that the State Board of Education add new §113.41(c)(20)(C) to read as follows:

“evaluate constitutional change in terms of strict construction versus judicial interpretation.”

The motion failed.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.41(c)(22) to read as follows:

“Citizenship. The student understands the promises of the Declaration of Independence and the protections of the U.S. Constitution and the Bill of Rights, efforts to expand the democratic process.”

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Beltran to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.41(c)(23)(B) to reinsert Hillary Clinton.

The motion carried with 12 members voting Aye and 2 members voting No as follows:

Aye:  Mr. Allen  Mr. Maynard
      Ms. Beltran  Mrs. Melton-Malone
      Mr. Bradley  Mr. Mercer
      Mrs. Cargill  Ms. Pérez
      Mr. Cortez  Ms. Perez-Diaz
      Dr. Ellis  Mr. Rowley

No:  Ms. Hardy
     Mrs. Miller

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.41(c)(25)(D) to reinsert Eleanor Roosevelt.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Rowley and seconded by Ms. Beltran to recommend that the State Board of Education strike §113.42(c)(13)(F) and amend to §113.42(c)(13)(E) to read as follows:

“summarize the rise of independence movements in Africa, the Middle East, and South Asia and reasons for ongoing conflicts, including the Arab-Israeli conflict;”

The motion failed with 6 members voting Aye and 8 members voting No as follows:

Aye:  Mr. Allen  Ms. Pérez
      Ms. Beltran  Ms. Perez-Diaz
      Mr. Cortez  Mr. Rowley

No:  Mr. Bradley  Mr. Maynard
     Mrs. Cargill  Mrs. Melton-Malone
     Dr. Ellis  Mr. Mercer
     Ms. Hardy  Mrs. Miller
MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Maynard and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.42(c)(13)(F) to read as follows:

“discuss factors contributing to the Arab-Israeli conflict, including the rejection of the existence of the State of Israel by the Arab League and a majority of Arab nations.”

Mrs. Bahorich recessed the meeting at 7:37 p.m.

The committee resumed action at 10:35 a.m. on Wednesday, November 14.

MOTION: It was moved by Ms. Beltran to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.42(c)(14)(B) to read as follows:

“This U.S. response to Islamic terrorism from September 11, 2001, to the present.”

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Bradley and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.42(c)(14)(B) to read as follows:

“This U.S. response to Islamic terrorism, including the events surrounding September 11, 2001.”

VOTE: A vote was taken on the original motion to amend §113.42(c)(14)(B) as amended. The motion carried.

The committee requested that staff make conforming edits to change “9/11” to September 11, 2001.”

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Beltran, seconded by Ms. Hardy, and carried, to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.42(c)(14)(A) to read as follows:

“summarize the development and impact of discuss the impact of geopolitical influences on the development of radical Islamic fundamentalism terrorism on events in the second half of the 20th century and the early 21st century, including terrorism and the growth of terrorist groups; and”

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Rowley and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education add new §113.42(c)(14)(B) to read as follows:

“discuss the impact of radical Islamic terrorism on global events in the second half of the 20th century and the early 21st century; and”

The motion carried.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Beltran and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.42(c)(14) to read as follows:

“History. The student understands the development and use of radical Islamic fundamentalism terrorism and the subsequent use of terrorism by some of its adherents.”

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education strike “Armenia” from §113.42(c)(14)(C) and insert “Armenia” §113.42(c)(14)(D).
MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Beltran and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.42(c)(24)(D) to read as follows:

“explain how geopolitical and religious developments in Islam influenced law and government in the Muslim world such as secularism, nationalism, and fundamentalism.”

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Beltran to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.44(c)(1)(C) to strike Moses.

The motion failed with 5 members voting Aye and 9 members voting No as follows:

Aye:
Mr. Allen  Ms. Pérez
Ms. Beltran  Ms. Perez-Diaz
Mr. Cortez

No:
Mr. Bradley  Mrs. Melton-Malone
Mrs. Cargill  Mr. Mercer
Dr. Ellis  Mrs. Miller
Ms. Hardy  Mr. Rowley
Mr. Maynard

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.44(c)(3) and §113.44(c)(3)(C) by replacing “divisions” with “districts”.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.44(c)(6)(F) to read as follows:

“identify how the Declaration of Independence and the U.S. Constitution continue to shape American beliefs and principles reflected in the Declaration of Independence and the U.S. Constitution are embodied in the United States today.”

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.44(c)(8)(D) to read as follows:

“explain how the U.S. Constitution limits constitutional provisions the power of national and state governments.”

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.44(c)(12) to read as follows:

“Citizenship. The student understands the rights that are protected and secured by the U.S. Constitution and Bill of Rights guaranteed by the U.S. Constitution.”

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.44(c)(12)(C) to read as follows:

“identify the freedoms and rights protected and secured guaranteed by each amendment in the Bill of Rights;”
**MOTION:** It was moved by Ms. Perez-Diaz to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.44(c)(12)(D) to read as follows:

“examine the reasons the Founding Fathers addressed religious freedom in America by including the establishment clause and free exercise clause.”

**MOTION AND VOTE:** It was moved by Ms. Pérez to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.44(c)(12)(D) to replace “examine the reasons why” with “examine how.” The motion failed.

**VOTE:** A vote was taken on the original motion to amend §113.44(c)(12)(D). The motion failed.

**MOTION AND VOTE:** It was moved by Ms. Hardy and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.44(c)(19)(A) to read as follows:

“trace the historical development of the civil rights movement from the late 1800s through the 21st century in the 19th, 20th, and 21st centuries, including the 13th, 14th, 15th, and 19th amendments and responses to Jim Crow laws.”

**MOTION AND VOTE:** It was moved by Ms. Hardy and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §113.41(c)(9)(B) to read as follows:

“explain how Jim Crow laws and the Ku Klux Klan created obstacles to civil rights for minorities such as the suppression of voting.”

**VOTE:** A vote was taken on the original motion to recommend that the State Board of Education approve for second reading and final adoption proposed revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 113, Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for Social Studies, Subchapter A, Elementary, Subchapter B, Middle School, Subchapter C, High School, and Subchapter D, Other Social Studies Courses, and proposed repeal of 19 TAC Chapter 118, Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for Economics with Emphasis on the Free Enterprise System and Its Benefits, Subchapter A, High School, and Subchapter B, Other Economics Courses, as amended with an effective date of August 26, 2019. The vote carried unanimously.

(Mr. Bradley, Mr. Mercer, and Mrs. Miller were absent for the vote.)

Mrs. Bahorich adjourned the meeting at 7:25 p.m.