The State Board of Education Committee of the Full Board met at 9:37 a.m. on Thursday, November 21, 2013, in the State Board of Education Room, #1-104, of the William B. Travis Building, 1701 N. Congress Avenue, Austin, Texas. All members of the committee were present, as follows:

Presiding: Barbara Cargill, chair; Lawrence A. Allen, Jr.; Donna Bahorich; David Bradley; Ruben Cortez, Jr.; Martha M. Dominguez; Pat Hardy; Mavis B. Knight; Tom Maynard; Sue Melton-Malone; Ken Mercer; Geraldine “Tincy” Miller; Marisa B. Perez; Thomas Ratliff; Marty Rowley

Public Testimony

This item provides an opportunity for the public to present testimony at the time the related item comes up for committee discussion or action. The procedures for registering and taking public testimony at State Board of Education committee meetings and general board meetings are provided at http://www.tea.state.tx.us/index4.aspx?id=25769804094 or in the information section (yellow pages) of the agenda.

The Committee of the Full Board heard public testimony on agenda item #3 and #4. Information regarding the individuals who presented public testimony is included in the discussion of that item.

DISCUSSION ITEM

1. Commissioner’s Comments Regarding the SBOE Agenda and Legislative Activities
   (Board agenda page I-161)

   Commissioner of Education Michael Williams was unable to attend the committee meeting due to health issues. Chief Deputy Commissioner Lizzette Reynolds, who offered remarks on his behalf, complimented the board for allowing many stakeholders to offer input about proposed graduation requirements during a November 20 hearing. She said the board faces an important series of votes on these requirements. The board at this meeting will also be reviewing the commissioner’s charter school selections and will consider approving for first reading and filing authorization a new bond guarantee program for charter schools, she said.

ACTION ITEMS

2. Proposed Amendment to 19 TAC Chapter 126, Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for Technology Applications, Subchapter C, High School, §126.37, Discrete Mathematics (One-Half to One Credit), Beginning with School Year 2012-2013
   (Second Reading and Final Adoption)
   (Board agenda page I-17)
   [Official agenda item #3]

   Monica Martinez, interim associate commissioner for standards and programs, explained that this item would amend the title of the technology applications discrete mathematics course in order to distinguish between two discrete mathematics courses.
MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Maynard, seconded by Mrs. Bahorich, and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education approve for second reading and final adoption proposed amendment to 19 TAC Chapter 126, Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for Technology Applications, Subchapter C, High School, §126.37, Discrete Mathematics, (One-Half to One Credit), Beginning with School Year 2012-2013, with an effective date of August 25, 2014.

(Second Reading and Final Adoption)
(Board agenda page I-29)
[Official agenda item #4]

Public testimony was provided by the following individuals:

NAME: Kenn Heydrick
AFFILIATION: Texas Science Education Leadership Association (TSELA)

NAME: Sandra West
AFFILIATION: Science Teachers Association of Texas

Ms. Martinez explained that the proposed amendments would add course options for students to satisfy mathematics and science graduation requirements.

MOTION: It was moved by Mr. Maynard and seconded by Ms. Hardy to recommend that the State Board of Education approve for second reading and final adoption proposed amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 74, Curriculum Requirements, Subchapter F, Graduation Requirements, Beginning with School Year 2007-2008, and Subchapter G, Graduation Requirements, Beginning with School Year 2012-2013, with an effective date of August 25, 2014.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Maynard, seconded by Mr. Rowley, and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education strike references to Veterinary Medical Applications throughout the proposed rules.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Dr. Dominguez and seconded by Ms. Hardy to recommend that the State Board of Education strike Principles of Engineering from the course options available for science credit. The motion failed.

VOTE: A vote was taken on Mr. Maynard’s original motion, as amended. The motion carried unanimously.
4. Proposed Revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 74, Curriculum Requirements, Subchapter B, Graduation Requirements

(First Reading and Filing Authorization)
(Board agenda page I-61)
[Official agenda item #5]

Invited testimony was provided by the following individuals:

NAME: Dr. Robert Nelson
AFFILIATION: The University of Texas-Pan American

NAME: Dr. Uri Treisman
AFFILIATION: Charles A. Dana Center
The University of Texas at Austin

Ms. Martinez explained that the proposed rules for the new graduation requirements had been posted to the TEA website for public review.

**MOTION:** It was moved by Mr. Maynard and seconded by Mr. Cortez to recommend that the State Board of Education approve for first reading and filing authorization proposed revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 74, Curriculum Requirements, Subchapter B, Graduation Requirements.

**MOTION:** It was moved by Mr. Ratliff and seconded by Mr. Cortez to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.11(e), as follows:

“A student may earn a distinguished level of achievement by successfully completing the curriculum requirements for the Foundation High School Program, and the curriculum requirements for at least one endorsement, and the other curriculum requirements required by TEC Sec. 28.025 (b-15), including four credits in science and four credits in mathematics to include including Algebra II as one of the four mathematics credits.”

**MOTION AND VOTE:** It was moved by Mrs. Miller, seconded by Ms. Hardy, and carried to amend Mr. Ratliff’s proposed amendment by striking “and the other curriculum requirements.”

**VOTE:** A vote was taken on Mr. Ratliff’s original motion, as amended. The motion carried.

**MOTION AND VOTE:** It was moved by Mr. Cortez, seconded by Mrs. Melton-Malone, and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.11(h), as follows:

“College Board advanced placement and International Baccalaureate courses may be substituted as appropriate for required courses. A single College Board advanced placement or International Baccalaureate course may not count toward more than one credit required for graduation. If a College Board advanced placement or International Baccalaureate course is substituted for a required course, that course may not satisfy a requirement for an advanced course, but may count toward both a required course and an endorsement. College Board advanced placement and International Baccalaureate courses may satisfy elective credit requirements.”
MOTION AND VOTE:  It was moved by Mr. Cortez, seconded by Mr. Mercer, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.11(i), as follows:

“Courses offered for dual credit at or in conjunction with an institution of higher education that provide advanced academic instruction beyond, or in greater depth than, the essential knowledge and skills for the equivalent high school course required for graduation may satisfy graduation requirements.”

MOTION AND VOTE:  It was moved by Mr. Ratliff, seconded by Mr. Cortez, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.11(i), as follows:

“Courses offered for dual credit at or in conjunction with an institution of higher education that provide advanced academic instruction beyond, or in greater depth than, the essential knowledge and skills for the equivalent high school course required for graduation may satisfy graduation requirements, including requirements for required courses, advanced courses, and courses for elective credit as well as requirements for endorsements.”

MOTION AND VOTE:  It was moved by Mr. Ratliff, seconded by Ms. Perez, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.11(l), as follows:

“Each school district shall annually report to the TEA the names of the locally developed courses, programs, institutions of higher education, and internships in which the district's students have enrolled as authorized by the Texas Education Code, §28.002(g-1). The TEA shall make available information provided under this subsection to other districts. If a district chooses, it may submit any locally developed course for approval under Section 74.27 as an innovative course. A district may submit any locally developed course to the TEA for approval as an innovative course.”

MOTION AND VOTE:  It was moved by Mr. Maynard, seconded by Mr. Ratliff, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.12(b)(1), as follows:

“English language arts--four credits. Three of the credits must consist of English I, II, and III. (Students with limited English proficiency who are at the beginning or intermediate level of English language proficiency, as defined by §74.4(d) of this title (relating to English Language Proficiency Standards), may satisfy the English I and English II graduation requirements by successfully completing English I for Speakers of Other Languages and English II for Speakers of Other Languages.) The additional credit may be selected from one full credit or a combination of two half credits from two different courses, subject to prerequisite requirements, from the following courses:”

MOTION AND VOTE:  It was moved by Mr. Cortez, seconded by Ms. Hardy, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education add to §74.12(b)(1) a new subparagraph (O) and (P), as follows:

“(O) Business English”
“(P) College Preparatory English”

(Mr. Bradley was absent for the vote.)
MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy and seconded by Mrs. Miller to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.12(b)(2), as follows:

“(2) Mathematics--three credits. Two of the credits must consist of Algebra I and Geometry.

(A) The additional credit may be selected from one full credit or a combination of two half credits, subject to prerequisite requirements, from the following courses if taken before the fourth mathematics credit:

(i) Mathematical Models with Applications;
(ii) Mathematical Applications in Agriculture, Food, and Natural Resources;
(iii) Digital Electronics;
(iv) Robotics Programming and Design;

(B) The additional credit may be selected from one full credit or a combination of two half credits, subject to prerequisite requirements, from the following courses:

(i) Algebra II;
(ii) Precalculus;
(iii) Mathematical Models with Applications;
(iv) Advanced Quantitative Reasoning;
(v) Independent Study in Mathematics;
(vi) Discrete Mathematics for Problem Solving;
(vii) AP Statistics;
(viii) AP Calculus AB;
(ix) AP Calculus BC;
(x) AP Computer Science;
(xi) IB Mathematical Studies Standard Level;
(xii) IB Mathematics Standard Level;
(xiii) IB Mathematics Higher Level;
(xiv) IB Further Mathematics Higher Level;
(xv) Engineering Mathematics;
(xvi) Statistics and Risk Management;
(xvii) Digital Electronics;
(xviii) Robotics Programming and Design;
(xix) Discrete Mathematics for Computer Science;
pursuant to the TEC, §28.025(b-5), after the successful completion of Algebra II, a mathematics course endorsed by an institution of higher education as a course for which the institution would award course credit or as a prerequisite for a course for which the institution would award course credit. The Texas Education Agency (TEA) shall maintain a current list of courses offered under this subparagraph; and

after the successful completion of Algebra I and Geometry, a locally developed mathematics course or other activity, including an apprenticeship or training hours needed to obtain an industry-recognized credential or certificate that is developed pursuant to the TEC, §28.002(g-1).”

The motion carried, with 8 members voting Aye and 7 members voting No, as follows:

**Aye:**
- Mrs. Bahorich
- Mr. Bradley
- Mrs. Cargill
- Dr. Dominguez
- Mrs. Miller

**No:**
- Mr. Allen
- Mr. Cortez
- Mrs. Knight
- Mr. Maynard

**MOTION AND VOTE:** It was moved by Mr. Cortez, seconded by Ms. Hardy, and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.12(b)(2)(A) and (B) by adding the words “from two different courses” after the language that reads “from one full credit or a combination of two half credits.”

There was no objection by the board in staff adding the words “from two different courses” after the language that reads “from one full credit or a combination of two half credits” as appropriate throughout §74.12.

**MOTION AND VOTE:** It was moved by Mr. Maynard, seconded by Ms. Hardy, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education strike §74.12(b)(3)(B)(xvii), Veterinary Medical Applications.

**MOTION:** It was moved by Mr. Cortez and seconded by Mrs. Knight to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.12(b)(5), as follows:

“(5) Languages other than English (LOTE)—two credits.

(B) If a student, in completing the first credit of LOTE, demonstrates that the student is unlikely to be able to complete the second credit, the student may substitute another appropriate course as follows:

(i) Special Topics in Language and Culture for the second credit of LOTE; or
(ii) another credit from Chapter 110, English Language Arts; Chapter 111, Mathematics; Chapter 112, Science; Chapter 113, Social Studies; or Chapter 114, LOTE and computer programming.

(C) The determination regarding a student's ability to complete the second credit of LOTE must be agreed to by:

(i) the teacher of the first LOTE credit course, the principal or designee, and the student's parent or person standing in parental relation; or

(ii) the student's admission, review, and dismissal (ARD) committee if the student receives special education services under the TEC, Chapter 29, Subchapter A.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Ratliff, seconded by Mrs. Knight, and carried to amend Mr. Cortez’s proposed amendment, as follows:

“(5) Languages other than English (LOTE)--two credits.

(B) If a student, in completing the first credit of LOTE, demonstrates that the student is unlikely to be able to complete the second credit, the student may substitute another appropriate course as follows:

(i) Special Topics in Language and Culture for the second credit of LOTE; or

(ii) another credit from Chapter 110, English Language Arts; Chapter 111, Mathematics; Chapter 112, Science; Chapter 113, Social Studies; or Chapter 114, LOTE and computer programming.

(C) The determination regarding a student's ability to complete the second credit of LOTE must be agreed to by:

(i) the teacher of the first LOTE credit course, the principal or designee, and the student's parent or person standing in parental relation; or

(ii) the student's admission, review, and dismissal (ARD) committee if the student receives special education services under the TEC, Chapter 29, Subchapter A; or

(iii) the committee established for the student under Section 504, Rehabilitation Act of 1973 (29 United States Code, Section 794) if the student does not receive special education services under the TEC, Chapter 29, Subchapter A, but is covered by the Rehabilitation Act of 1973.”

VOTE: A vote was taken on Mr. Cortez’s original motion, as amended. The motion carried.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Cortez, seconded by Mr. Mercer, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.12(b)(5)(C), as follows:

“(C) A student, who due to a disability, is unable to complete two credits in the same language in a language other than English, may substitute a combination of two credits from English language arts, mathematics, science, or social studies or two credits in career and technical education or technology applications for the LOTE credit requirements. The determination regarding a student's ability to complete the LOTE credit requirements will be made by:"

(Ms. Perez, Mr. Ratliff, and Mr. Rowley were absent for the vote.)
MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Ratliff, seconded by Mrs. Miller, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.12(b)(6)(F), as follows:

“(F) A student who is unable to participate in physical activity due to a disability or illness may substitute an academic elective credit (English language arts, mathematics, science, or social studies) or a course that is offered for credit as provided by TEC Sec. 28.002(g-1), for the physical education credit requirement. The determination regarding a student's ability to participate in physical activity will be made by.”

(Ms. Perez was absent for the vote.)

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Maynard and seconded by Mr. Allen that the State Board of Education strike §74.12(b)(7), as follows:

(7) Speech—one half credit. The credit may be selected from the following courses:

(A) Communication Applications; and

(B) Professional Communications.

The motion carried, with 8 members voting Aye and 6 members voting No, as follows:

Aye: Mr. Allen Mr. Maynard
Mrs. Bahorich Mrs. Melton-Malone
Ms. Hardy Mr. Ratliff
Mrs. Knight Mr. Rowley

No: Mr. Bradley Dr. Dominguez
Mrs. Cargill Mr. Mercer
Mr. Cortez Mrs. Miller

(Ms. Perez was absent for the vote.)

Upon returning to the board room, Ms. Perez indicated her intent to vote Aye on Mr. Maynard’s motion to strike §74.12(b)(7). There were no objections.

The board directed staff to change the number of elective credits to five credits to reflect the elimination of the speech requirement.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Cortez and seconded by Mr. Bradley to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.13(b) by striking the sentence that reads “This section does not entitle a student to remain enrolled to earn more than 26 credits.” The motion failed.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Cortez, seconded by Mr. Ratliff, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.13(d)(2) by adding “from two different courses” after the language that reads “from one full credit or a combination of two half credits.”
**MOTION:** It was moved by Mr. Rowley and seconded by. Ratliff to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.13(b), as follows:

“(b) A district shall permit a student to enroll in courses under more than one endorsement before the student’s junior year and to choose, at any time, to earn an endorsement other than the endorsement the student previously indicated. The district may place a student in a course or courses needed for graduation, and this section does not entitle a student to remain enrolled to earn more than 26 credits.”

**MOTION AND VOTE:** It was moved by Mr. Mercer and seconded by Dr. Dominguez to amend Mr. Rowley’s proposed amendment, as follows:

“(b) A district shall permit a student to enroll in courses under more than one endorsement before the student’s junior year and to choose, at any time, to earn an endorsement other than the endorsement the student previously indicated. The district may place a student in a course or courses needed for graduation with an endorsement, and this section does not entitle a student to remain enrolled to earn more than 26 credits.”

The motion failed.

Mr. Rowley withdrew his original motion.

The board directed staff to add §74.13(d)(2)(T), Mathematical Applications in Agriculture, Food and Natural Resources.

The board directed staff to strike §74.13(d)(3)(Q), Veterinary Medical Applications, in order to align with a previous motion.

**MOTION AND VOTE:** It was moved by Mr. Ratliff, seconded by Mr. Mercer, and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education add new §74.13(d) to read, as follows:

“(d) A school district may determine a coherent sequence of courses for an endorsement area, provided that prerequisites in Chapters 110-130 are followed.”

(Rev. Dominguez and Mrs. Melton-Malone were absent for the vote.)

**MOTION AND VOTE:** It was moved by Mr. Ratliff, seconded by Ms. Hardy, and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.12(c), as follows:

“(c) The credits must be selected from the list of courses specified in §74.11(g) of this title (relating to High School Graduation Requirements) or from a locally developed course or activity developed pursuant to TEC Sec 28.002 (g-1) for which a student may receive credit and which is not counted toward another graduation requirement.”
MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Hardy, seconded by Mrs. Bahorich, and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.13(d)(2), as follows:

“(2) An additional credit in mathematics that may be selected from one full credit or a combination of two half credits from two different courses, subject to prerequisite requirements, from the following courses:
   (A) Algebra II;
   (B) Precalculus;
   (C) Mathematical Models with Applications;
   (D) Advanced Quantitative Reasoning;
   (E) Independent Study in Mathematics;
   (F) Discrete Mathematics for Problem Solving;
   (G) Advanced Placement (AP) Statistics;
   (H) AP Calculus AB;
   (I) AP Calculus BC;
   (J) AP Computer Science;
   (K) International Baccalaureate (IB) Mathematical Studies Standard Level;
   (L) IB Mathematics Standard Level;
   (M) IB Mathematics Higher Level;
   (N) IB Further Mathematics Higher Level;
   (O) Engineering Mathematics;
   (P) Statistics and Risk Management;
   (Q) Digital Electronics;
   (R) Robotics Programming and Design;
   (S) Discrete Mathematics for Computer Science;
   (T) Mathematical Applications in Agriculture, Food, and Natural Resources;
   (U) pursuant to the Texas Education Code (TEC), §28.025(b-5), after the successful completion of Algebra II, a mathematics course endorsed by an institution of higher education as a course for which the institution would award course credit or as a prerequisite for a course for which the institution would award course credit. The Texas Education Agency (TEA) shall maintain a current list of courses offered under this subparagraph; and
   (V) after the successful completion of Algebra I and Geometry, a locally developed mathematics course or other activity, including an apprenticeship or training hours needed to obtain an industry-recognized credential or certificate that is developed pursuant to the TEC, §28.002(g-1).”
The additional mathematics credit may be selected from one full credit or a combination of two half credits from two different courses, subject to prerequisite requirements, from the following courses if taken after the third mathematics credit:

(A) Mathematical Models with Applications;
(B) Mathematical Applications in Agriculture, Food, and Natural Resources;
(C) Digital Electronics; and
(D) Robotics Programming and Design.”

**MOTION AND VOTE:** It was moved by Mr. Rowley and seconded by Mrs. Knight to recommend that the State Board of Education strike the phrase “including Algebra II” from §74.13(e)(2)-(5). The motion carried. Dr. Dominguez opposed the motion.

The board directed staff to add references to Chapter 127 in the rule where Chapter 130 is mentioned and where appropriate.

**MOTION AND VOTE:** It was moved by Mr. Ratliff, seconded by Mr. Allen, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.13(e)(1)(A), as follows:

“(A) a coherent sequence of three or more credits four courses in career and technical education (CTE) that are obtained from includes at least two courses in the same career cluster and at least one advanced CTE course. The courses may be selected from Chapter 130 of this title (relating to Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for Career and Technical Education), Chapter 127 of this title (relating to Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for Career Development), or CTE innovative courses approved by the commissioner of education. The final course in the sequence must be selected from one of the CTE career clusters listed in the following:”

**MOTION AND VOTE:** It was moved by Mr. Ratliff, seconded by Mr. Maynard, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.13(e)(1)(C), as follows:

“(C) four credits courses in mathematics by successfully completing Algebra II and three additional mathematics courses for which Algebra II is a prerequisite by selecting courses from Subsection (d)(2) of this Section Chapter 111 of this title (relating to Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for Mathematics); or”

**MOTION AND VOTE:** It was moved by Mr. Ratliff, seconded by Ms. Hardy, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.13(e)(1)(D), as follows:

“(D) four credits courses in science by successfully completing physics and three additional science courses by selecting courses from Subsection (d)(3) of this Section Chapter 112 of this title (relating to Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for Science).”
MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Ratliff, seconded by Mrs. Bahorich, and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.13(e)(1)(B), as follows:

“(B) Chapter 126 of this title (relating to Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for Technology Applications) and Computer Programming and Advanced Computer Programming from Chapter 130; or”

(Mr. Mercer was absent for the vote.)

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Ratliff, seconded by Dr. Dominguez, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.13(e)(2)(A), as follows:

“(A) a coherent sequence of three or more credits four courses in CTE that includes at least two courses in the same career cluster and at least one advanced CTE course, which may include any course that is the third or higher course in a sequence. The courses may be selected from Chapter 130 of this title, Chapter 127 of this title (relating to Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for Career Development), or CTE innovative courses approved by the commissioner. The final course in the sequence must be obtained selected from one of the CTE career clusters listed in the following:”

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Ratliff, seconded by Dr. Dominguez, and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.13(e)(2)(B), as follows:

“(B) four English elective credits courses by selecting courses from Chapter 110 of this title to include three levels in one of the following areas:

(i) advanced broadcast journalism; or

(ii) newspaper; or

(iii) public speaking; or

(iv) debate.”

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Ratliff, seconded by Ms. Hardy, and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.13(e)(3), as follows:

“(3) a coherent sequence of three credits four courses in CTE that includes at least two courses in the same career cluster and at least one advanced CTE course. The courses may be selected from Chapter 130 of this title, Chapter 127 of this title (relating to Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for Career Development), or CTE innovative courses approved by the commissioner. The final credit course in the sequence must be selected from one of the CTE career clusters listed in the following:”

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Ratliff, seconded by Mr. Rowley, and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education add new §74.13(e)(4)(B)(i) to read as follows:

“(i) two levels of the same language in a language other than English and two levels of a different language in a language other than English”
MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Perez, seconded by Dr. Dominguez, and carried to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.14(b)(1), as follows:

“(1) A student may earn a performance acknowledgment by demonstrating proficiency, in accordance with local district grading policy, in two or more languages by:”

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Ratliff and seconded by Mr. Rowley to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.14(c), as follows:

“(c) A student may earn a performance acknowledgment on the student’s diploma and transcript for outstanding performance on a College Board advanced placement test or International Baccalaureate examination by earning:

(1) a score of 3 or above 4 or 5 on a College Board advanced placement examination; or
(2) a score of 4 5 or above on an International Baccalaureate examination for a higher-level course.”

The motion failed.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Maynard, seconded by Mr. Rowley, and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education amend §74.14(e)(1), as follows:

“(1) performance on an examination or series of examinations sufficient to obtain a nationally or internationally recognized business or industry certification; or”

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Ratliff, seconded by Ms. Hardy, and carried unanimously to recommend that the State Board of Education add new §74.12(b)(6)(B) to read as follows:

“(B) In accordance with local district policy, the required credit may be earned through completion of any Texas essential knowledge and skills-based course that meets the requirement in subparagraph (E) of this paragraph for 100 minutes of moderate to vigorous physical activity per five-day school week and that is not being used to satisfy another specific graduation requirement.”

VOTE: A vote was taken on the motion to recommend that the State Board of Education approve for first reading and filing authorization proposed revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 74, Curriculum Requirements, Subchapter B, Graduation Requirements, as amended. The motion carried.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

5. Discussion of Proposed Revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 74, Curriculum Requirements, Subchapter A, Required Curriculum
(Board agenda page I-163)

The committee did not take up the item and will consider a proposal for first reading and filing authorization in January 2014.
6. **Discussion of New Course Development**  
(Board agenda page I-179)

Ms. Martinez explained that this item provides the opportunity for the committee to discuss new courses that must be developed to align with requirements of recent legislation and other courses that the board may want to have developed to increase flexibility in course options for students under the new foundation high school program.

**ACTION ITEMS**

7. **Report and Recommendations from the Commissioner of Education Regarding Instructional Materials Offered for Adoption under Proclamation 2014**  
(Board agenda page I-95)  
[Official agenda item #6]

John Lopez, managing director, instructional materials and educational technology, presented the list of instructional materials to be considered for adoption, the list of instructional materials to be considered for rejection, and an executive summary of the report of required corrections of factual errors.

**MOTION:** It was moved by Mr. Bradley and seconded by Ms. Hardy to recommend that the State Board of Education:

*Require that all publishers make corrections listed in the Report Concerning Required Corrections of Factual Errors;*

*Require that all instructional materials meet established manufacturing standards and specifications;*

*Approve changes and corrections in response to written comments and public testimony;*

*Place the instructional materials submitted for adoption on the adopted list as indicated on the Proclamation 2014 List of Instructional Materials to be Considered for Adoption, and reject instructional materials as indicated on the Proclamation 2014 List of Instructional Materials to be Considered for Rejection.*

**MOTION:** It was moved by Ms. Hardy, seconded by Mr. Rowley, and carried unanimously to amend the motion to recommend that the State Board of Education delegate to a committee of three board members – the board chair, Mrs. Melton-Malone, and Dr. Dominguez – to select three experts to resolve the alleged errors found in Pearson Biology, Texas Edition-Student Edition and Pearson Biology, Texas Edition-Student eText. If the alleged errors are resolved to the satisfaction of the experts, the instructional materials will be considered adopted. If they cannot be resolved, the instructional materials will be withdrawn or returned to the board for consideration in January.
MOTION: It was moved by Mr. Ratliff and seconded by Mrs. Knight to amend the motion to increase the number of experts from three to four with two being selected by the board and two selected by the publisher. The two selected by the publisher may not be compensated by the publisher.

Mr. Ratliff withdrew his motion without objection.

VOTE: A vote was taken on Ms. Hardy’s motion. The motion carried.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Ms. Perez, seconded by Mr. Ratliff, and carried to require the work of the experts to be completed within four weeks.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Maynard, seconded by Ms. Hardy, and carried to divide the question to separate the Houghton Mifflin Harcourt’s Environmental Science Digital Solution and Environmental Science Print/Digital Solution material from the other instructional materials being considered for adoption.

VOTE: A vote was taken on Mr. Bradley’s original motion with respect to all instructional materials considered for adoption, except for Houghton Mifflin Harcourt’s Environmental Science Digital Solution and Environmental Science Print/Digital Solution. The motion carried.

MOTION AND VOTE: It was moved by Mr. Ratliff, seconded by Ms. Perez, and carried to amend Mr. Bradley’s original motion to approve Houghton Mifflin Harcourt’s Environmental Science Digital Solution and Environmental Science Print/Digital Solution contingent upon the publisher making changes according to the memo titled Houghton Mifflin Harcourt Response to Written Comments from Becky Berger.

VOTE: A vote was taken on Mr. Bradley’s original motion as amended concerning Houghton Mifflin Harcourt’s Environmental Science Digital Solution and Environmental Science Print/Digital Solution. The motion carried.

8. Proposed Amendments to 19 TAC Chapter 66, State Adoption and Distribution of Instructional Materials, Subchapter B, State Adoption of Instructional Materials
(First Reading and Filing Authorization)
(Board agenda page I-99)
[Official agenda item #7]

This item was postponed to Friday, November 22, 2014.

9. Amendments to Proclamation 2015 of the State Board of Education Advertising for Bids on Instructional Materials
(Board agenda page I-103)
[Official agenda item #8]

This item was postponed to Friday, November 22, 2014.
DISCUSSION ITEMS

10. Discussion of Proposed Revisions to 19 TAC Chapter 114, Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills for Languages Other Than English, Subchapter A, Elementary, Subchapter B, Middle School, and Subchapter C, High School
   (Board agenda page I-191)

   This item was postponed to Friday, November 22, 2014.

11. Update on Texas Essential Knowledge and Skills (TEKS) Review
   (Board agenda page I-199)

   The committee did not take up this item.

12. Update from the CSCOPE Ad Hoc Committee
   (Board agenda page I-207)

   This item was postponed to Friday, November 22, 2014.

13. Discussion of Pending Litigation
   (Board agenda page I-121)

   The committee did not discuss pending litigation; therefore, no executive session was held.

Mrs. Cargill adjourned the meeting at 12:05 a.m.