The Education Trust

12 September 2016

## Achievement and Opportunity in America: What Can We Do?

Conference on Educating Students in Poverty Austin, Texas

## America: Two Powerful Stories

# 1. Land of Opportunity: 

## Work hard, and you can become anything you want to be.

## 2. Generational Advancement:

Through hard work, each generation of parents can assure a better life - and better education - for their children.

# These stories animated hopes and dreams of people here at home 

And drew countless immigrants to our shores

# Yes, America was often intolerant... 

## And they knew the "Dream" was a work in progress.

## We were:

- The first to provide universal high school;
- The first to build public universities;
- The first to build community colleges;
- The first to broaden access to college, through GI Bill, Pell Grants,

Percent of U.S. adults with a high school diploma


Percent of U.S. adults with a B.A. or more


## Progress was painfully slow, especially for people of color. But year by year, decade by decade...

Percent of U.S. adults with a high school diploma, by race


Percent of U.S. adults with a B.A. or more, by race 2012


Then, beginning in the eighties, growing economic inequality started eating away at our progress.

# In recent years, most income gains have gone to those at the top of the ladder, while those at the bottom have fallen backwards. 

## Instead of being the most equal, the U.S. has the third highest income inequality among OECD nations.



Note: Gini coefficient ranges from 0 to 1 , where 0 indicates total income equality and 1 indicates total income inequality.

Not just wages and wealth, but social mobility as well.

## U.S. intergenerational mobility was improving until 1980, but barriers have gotten higher since.



## The US now has one of lowest rates of intergenerational mobility

Cross-country examples of the link between father and son wages


At macro level, better and more equal education is not the only answer.

## But at the individual level, it really is.

## There is one road up, and that road runs through us.

## So, how are we doing?



## First, some good news.

After more than a decade of fairly flat achievement and stagnant or growing gaps in K-12, we appear to be turning the corner with our elementary students.

## Since 1999, large gains for all groups of students, especially students of color

## 9 Year Olds - NAEP Reading



# Since 1999, performance rising for all groups of students 

9 Year Olds - NAEP Math


160

Middle grades are up, too.


## Over the last decade, all groups have steadily improved and gaps have narrowed




## Bottom Line:

## When we really focus on something, we make progress!

# Clearly, much more remains to be done in elementary and middle school 

Too many youngsters still enter high school way behind.

# But at least we have some traction on elementary and middle school problems. 

The same is NOT true of our high schools.

## Achievement is flat in reading for students overall.

17-Year-Olds Overall - NAEP


## Math achievement for students overall is flat over time.



And despite earlier improvements, gaps between groups haven't narrowed much since the late 80s and early 90s.

## Reading: Not much gap narrowing since 1988.

17 Year Olds - NAEP Reading


## Math: Not much gap closing since 1990.

17 Year Olds - NAEP Math


# Moreover, no matter how you cut the data, our students aren't doing well compared with their peers in other countries. 

## Of 34 OECD Countries, U.S.A. Ranks $17^{\text {th }}$ in Reading



## Of 34 OECD Countries, U.S.A. Ranks $20^{\text {th }}$ in Science 2012 PISA - Science



Higher than U.S. average $\square$ Not measurably different from U.S. average $\square$ Lower than U.S. average

## Of 34 OECD Countries, U.S.A. Ranks $27^{\text {th }}$ in Math

 Literacy2012 PISA - Math


# Only place we rank high? 

## Inequality.

Among OECD Countries, U.S.A. has the $4^{\text {th }}$ Largest Gap Between High-SES and Low-SES Students

2006 PISA - Science


Among OECD Countries, U.S.A. has the $5^{\text {th }}$ Largest Gap Between High-SES and Low-SES Students

2009 PISA - Reading



# Gaps in achievement begin before children arrive at the schoolhouse door. 

But, rather than organizing our educational
system to ameliorate this problem, we organize it to exacerbate the problem.

## How?

## By giving students who arrive with less, less in school, too.

## Some of these "lesses" are a result of choices that policymakers make.

## National Inequities in State and Local Revenue Per Student

|  | Gap |
| :--- | :---: |
| High Poverty vs. | $-\$ 1200$ |
| Low Poverty Districts | per student |
| High Minority vs. | $-\$ 2,000$ |
| Low Minority Districts | per student |

## State-by-State Funding Equity: Texas $4^{\text {th }}$ from Bottom

(spending not adjusted for extra cost of educating poor children)
Figure 1: Gap in State and Local Revenues per Student Between Districts Serving the Most and the Fewest Students in Poverty


## State-by-State Funding Equity: Texas 3rd from Bottom

(spending adjusted for extra cost of educating poor children)

Figure 2: Gap in State and Local Revenues per Student Between Districts Serving the Most and the Fewest Students in Poverty (Adjusted to Account for Additional Needs of Low-Income Students)


## State-by-State Funding Equity By Concentration of Students of Color: TX $4^{\text {th }}$ From Bottom

Figure 6: Gaps in State and Local Revenues Between Districts Serving the Most and the Fewest Students of Color (Not Adjusted for Adaitional Needs of Low-Income students)


# In truth, though, some of the most devastating "lesses" are a function of choices that we educators make. 

Choices we make about what to expect of whom.....

## Students in poor schools receive As for work that would earn Cs in affluent schools.


$\square$ Low-poverty schools ■ High-poverty schools

## Choices we make about what to teach whom...

# Even African-American students with high math performance in fifth grade are unlikely to be placed in algebra in eighth grade 



## And choices we make about who teaches whom...

## Students at high-minority schools more likely to be taught by novice* teachers.



Note: High minority school: 75\% or more of the students are Black, Hispanic, American Indian or Alaskan Native, Asian or Pacific Islander. Low-minority school: $10 \%$ or fewer of the students are non-White students. Novice teachers are those with three years or fewer experience.
Source: Analysis of 2003-2004 Schools and Staffing Survey data by Richard Ingersoll, University of Pennsylvania 2007.

Math classes at high-poverty, high-minority secondary schools are more likely to be taught by
out-of-field* teachers


Note: High-poverty school: 55 percent or more of the students are eligible for free/reduced-price lunch. Low-poverty school :15 percent or fewer of the students are eligible for free/reduced-price lunch. High-minority school: 78 percent or more of the students are black, Hispanic, American Indian or Alaskan Native, Asian or Pacific Islander. Low-minority school : 12 percent or fewer of the students are non-white studenters with neither certification nor major. Data for secondary-level core academic classes (math, science, social studies, English) across the U.S.
Source: Education Trust Analysis of 2007-08 Schools and Staffing Survey data.

## Los Angeles: Black, Latino students have fewer

 highly effective teachers, more weak ones.```
READING/LANGUAGE ARTS
Latino and black students are:

\section*{The results are devastating.}

Kids who come in a little behind, leave a lot behind.

And these are the students who remain in school through \(12^{\text {th }}\) grade.

\section*{Students of color are less likely to graduate from high school on time.}

Class of 2013


\title{
Add those numbers up and throw in college entry and graduation, and different groups of young Americans obtain degrees and very different rates...
}

Whites attain bachelor's degrees at twice the rate of blacks and three times the rate of Hispanics.

Bachelor's Degree Attainment of Young Adults
(25-29-year-olds), 2011



These numbers are not good news for our country—or for the lives of the young people in question.

\title{
Chances of Staying at the Bottom If You're Born at the Bottom
}


3

Source: Haskins, Holzer, and Lerman. Promoting Economic Mobility by Increasing Postsecondary Education. Economic Mobility Project, Pew CharitableTrusts, 2009

\section*{Among black men, education makes a huge difference in life outcomes}

Cumulative Risk of Imprisonment by Age 34
for Young Black Men:


Source: Bruce Western and Becky Pe

\section*{What Can We Do?}

\section*{An awful lot of Americans have decided that we can't do} much.

\section*{What We Hear Many Educators Say:}
- They're poor
- Their parents don't care
- They come to schools without breakfast
- Not enough books
- Not enough parents

Let's be clear, these things do matter.

\section*{Child Poverty in the US, 2013}
\begin{tabular}{|l|l|}
\hline & \\
\hline White & \(13.4 \%\) \\
\hline Black & \(36.9 \%\) \\
\hline Hispanic & \(30.4 \%\) \\
\hline Asian & \(9.6 \%\) \\
\hline ALL & \(19.9 \%\) \\
\hline
\end{tabular}

And let's also be clear: tolerating high child poverty rates is a policy choice. Though we remain the richest nation on earth...

\section*{U.S. Ranks Second to Last in Child Poverty}


Yet, how we as educators respond to the effects of that choice is a choice, too.

We can choose to go along with what has become conventional wisdom in our profession-that, until we fix poverty, there's not much we educators can do...

\section*{Or we can choose differently.}
...joining colleagues in schools all over this country that serve very poor kids but get very good results.

\section*{George Hall Elementary School}

\section*{Mobile, Alabama}
- 545 students in grades PK-5
- 99\% African American
- 98\% Low Income


\section*{Big Improvement at George Hall Elementary}


\section*{Exceeding Standards: George Hall students outperform white students in Alabama}


\section*{Halle Hewetson Elementary School Las Vegas, NV}
- 962 students in grades PK - 5
- 85\% Latino
- 7\% African American
- 100\% Low Income
- 71\% Limited English Proficient

\section*{Big Improvement at Halle Hewetson Elementary}

Latino Students - Grade 3 Reading


\section*{High Performance Across Groups at Halle Hewetson Elementary}

Grade 3 Math (2011)


\section*{Exceeding Standards at Halle Hewetson Elementary}

Low-Income Students - Grade 3 Math (2011)


\section*{Elmont Memorial High School Elmont, New York}

\section*{2011-2012 School Year}
- 1,907 students in grades 7-12
- 78\% African American
- 12\% Latino


\section*{High Performance by ALL Students at Elmont Memorial High School}

Secondary Level Math (2012)


\section*{High Performance by ALL Students at Elmont Memorial High School}

Secondary Level English (2012)


\section*{High Graduation Rates at Elmont Memorial High School}


This is what happens when teams of educators choose differently.

KARIN CHENOWETH CHRISTINA THEOKAS Dene
Deting It
LEADING
ACADEMIC SUCCESS
iiv
UNEXPECTED SCHOOLS

\section*{Available from Harvard Education Press and amazon.com}


\section*{Just flukes, outliers?}

No. Very big differences at district level, too-even in the progress and performance of the "same" group of students.

\section*{Average Scale Scores, by District Low-Income African American Students}


\section*{Average Scale Scores, by District \\ Low-Income Latino Students}


\section*{Average Scale Scores, by District Low-Income African American Students}



Even at the state level, there are very big differences in achievement-even of the same group of children.

\section*{Some high achieving and high improving, some low achieving and low improving, with others in between.}

Performance and Improvement, Low-Income Students: Grade 4 Math


\section*{Performance and Improvement: Grade 8 Math}


\section*{Performance and Improvement: Grade 4 Reading}

Grade 4 Reading: Low Income Students
ㄹ


\section*{Performance and Improvement: Grade 8 Reading}


\section*{Bottom Line: What We Do Matters!}

\section*{What Can We Learn From Top Performers and Top Gainers?}

Five common sense, but ultimately disruptive ideas.

\section*{\#1. Good schools, districts don't leave anything about teaching and learning to chance.}

An awful lot of our teachers-even brand new ones-are left to figure out on their own what to teach and what constitutes "good enough" work.

What does this do?
Leaves teachers entirely on their own to figure out what to teach, what order to teach it in, HOW to teach it...and to what level.

\section*{'A' Work in Poor Schools Would Earn 'Cs' in Affluent Schools}

\(\square\) Low-poverty schools \(\quad\) High-poverty schools
Source: Prospects (ABT Associates, 1993), in "Prospects: Final Report on Student Outcomes", PES, DOE, 1997.

\title{
Students can do no better than the assignments they are given...
}

\section*{Grade 10 Writing Assignment}

A frequent theme in literature is the conflict between the individual and society. From literature you have read, select a character who struggled with society. In a well-developed essay, identify the character and explain why this character's conflict with society is important.

\section*{Grade 10 Writing Assignment}

Write a composition of at least 4 paragraphs on Martin Luther King's most important contribution to this society. Illustrate your work with a neat cover page. Neatness counts.

\section*{Grade 7 Writing Assignment}

\section*{Essay on Anne Frank}

Your essay will consist of an opening paragraph which introduced the title, author and general background of the novel.

Your thesis will state specifically what Anne's overall personality is, and what general psychological and intellectual changes she exhibits over the course of the book

You might organize your essay by grouping psychological and intellectual changes OR you might choose 3 or 4 characteristics (like friendliness, patience, optimism, self doubt) and show how she changes in this area.

\section*{Grade 7 Writing Assignment}

-My Best Friend:

\section*{-A chore I hate:}

\section*{-A car I want:}

\section*{-My heartthrob:}

\title{
That was pre- "College-and-Career Ready Standards?"
}

Do new standards change that?
A brand new EdTrust study

\section*{A Deeper Look at What We Did}

\section*{Analyzed and scored close to 1,600 assignments} using our Literacy Assignment Analysis Framework.


Additional Features Analyzed
- Text Type and Length
- Writing Output
- Length of Assignment
- Student Thinking

\section*{GRADE 7- English Language Arts}

How can we make out voices heard? After reading / am Malala, write a literary essay in which you answer this question. Select and analyze one of the following:
- Any key person from the text
- The setting
- A theme from the text

Support your argument with evidence from the text. In your piece, be sure to write at least 5 paragraphs and follow the structure of a literary analysis.

\section*{GRADE 7 - English Language Arts}
Read the poem, then fill in the blanks to create your own poem to communicate your thoughts and feelings about unfinished business in your life.

The Song I couldn't Finish
by Jeanne
The words / couldn't say
The call I couldn't make
The time / couldn't spend with you
The walls I couldn't break through
The breath I couldn't take
The air I couldn't release
The love I couldn't feel
The person I couldn't convince
The song I couldn't finish

\section*{GRADE 7 - English Language Arts \\ (continued)}

The words I couldn't say
/ couldn't say
The things I couldn't change
/ couldn't \(\qquad\)
The walls I couldn't break through
I couldn't find a way to \(\qquad\)
The feelings I couldn't feel
/ couldn't \(\qquad\)
The help I couldn't give
/ couldn't \(\qquad\)
The song I couldn't finish
The song was about \(\qquad\)

\title{
In isolation, the low assignments can reflect targeted skill building and student practice...not necessarily harmful in moderation
}

However when compounded over multiple class periods, in multiple subjects, over multiple years, the effect is detrimental.

\section*{Ed Trust Assignment Study: What We Found}
- Fewer than 4 in 10 middle grades assignments are targeted at a grade-appropriate standard;
- In high poverty schools the proportion drops to only about one third, compared to nearly half of assignments in low poverty schools;
- That said, only about 5\% of assignments in both kinds of schools tapped into the higher-level cognitive demands of the CCSS;
- Most efforts at engagement and relevance were superficial, and often condescending.

\section*{And don't think that your students don't know the difference....}
"We were going to be taking the same exact AP test as the students we met from the other school. We needed to know the same exact things. But, while they were starting to read the Odyssey, we were reading the Hunger Games. There's nothing wrong with the Hunger Games. I love the Hunger Games---I read it when I was 12. It just really struck me as unfair."
"My teacher right now, she's hard but she does it for our own good. Because when we go to college, it is gonna be hard. Like Shakespeare---that was really hard for me. When I came over here I was like, 'man, what am I reading? I can't understand anything!' I was like, 'how could they talk like that?! Did they really understand each other?!' But then she taught me how to understand it. And it felt good cuz I actually learned Shakespeare-it's weird but I'm getting it."

\section*{High Performing Schools and Districts Know That Standards Alone Aren't Enough}
- Have clear and specific goals for what students should learn in every grade, including the order in which they should learn it;
- Provide teachers with common curriculum, assignments;
- Have regular vehicle to assure common marking standards;
- Assess students regularly to measure progress; and,
- Don't leave student supports to chance.

\section*{In other words, they strive for consistency in everything they do.}
\#2. Good schools, districts know how much teachers matter, and they act on that knowledge.

\section*{Not leaving anything to chance means not leaving who teaches whom to chance, either.}

\section*{In our roles as parents...}

\section*{Students in Dallas Gain More in Math with Effective Teachers: One Year Growth From 3 \(3^{\text {rod }}\) \(4^{\text {th }}\) Grade}


\title{
DIFFERENCES IN TEACHER EFFECTIVENESS ACCOUNT FOR LARGE DIFFERENCES IN STUDENT LEARNING
}


\title{
ACCESS TO MULTIPLE EFFECTIVE TEACHERS CAN DRAMATICALLY AFFECT STUDENT LEARNING
}
CST math proficiency
trends for second-graders
at 'Below Basic' or 'Far
Below Basic' in 2007 who
subsequently had three
consecutive high or low
value-added teachers

\section*{And, no matter how you measure, some kids aren't getting their fair share.}

\section*{Students at High-Minority Schools More Likely to Be Taught By Novice* Teachers}


Note: High minority school-75\% or more of the students are Black, Hispanic, American Indian or Alaskan Native, Asian or Pacific Islander. Low-minority school -10\% or fewer of the students are non-White students.

\section*{Math Classes at High-Poverty and High- Minority Schools More Likely to be Taught by Out of Field* Teachers}


Note: High Poverty school-75\% or more of the students are eligible for free/reduced price lunch. Low-poverty school - \(15 \%\) or fewer of the students are eligible for free/reduced price lunch. High minority school-75\% or more of the students are Black, Hispanic, American Indian or Alaskan Native, Asian or Pacific Islander. Low-minority school - \(10 \%\) or fewer of the students are non-White students.

\title{
Tennessee: High poverty/high minority schools have fewer of the "most effective" teachers and more "least effective" teachers
}


\section*{Los Angeles: LOW-INCOME STUDENTS LESS LIKELY TO HAVE HIGH VALUEADDED TEACHERS}

ELA

A low-income student is more than twice as likely to have a low value-added teacher for ELA

A student from a relatively more affluent background is \(62 \%\) more likely to get a high value-added ELA teacher.


In math, a student from a relatively more affluent background is \(39 \%\) more likely to get a high valueadded math teacher.

A lowincome student is 66\% more likely to have a low valueadded teacher.

Remember: These same inequities often occur even within the same school, where the most experienced and best educated teachers teach the "top" kids and the seniors, while the novices are assigned to
"remedial" kids and freshmen.

\section*{Low-Achieving Students are More Likely to be Assigned to Ineffective Teachers than Effective Teachers}


\title{
These patterns not, however, inevitable.
}

Charlotte's Strategic Staffing Initiative

\section*{Putting it All Together: Charlotte's Strategic Staffing Initiative}
- Experienced, high performing principal;
- Gets to bring in 6 high performing teachers from elsewhere in district, and bump out that many low performers;
- Two years of autonomy to produce turn around results;
- Near \(100 \%\) results.
\#3. Good schools, districts don't think about closing the achievement gap only as "bringing the bottom up."

\title{
In part because of the push from NCLB, there's been a lot of energy directed at bringing bottom achievers up.
}

\section*{Percentage Below Basic Over Time}


\section*{Percentage Below Basic Over Time}


\section*{At the same time, though...}

\section*{Percentage Advanced Over Time}


\section*{Percentage Advanced Over Time}

African-American Students (National Public) - Grade 8 NAEP Math


\section*{Percentage Advanced Over Time}

Latino Students (National Public) - Grade 8 NAEP Math


\section*{We can—and must-do better.}

\title{
\#4. In good schools, educators know that they have enormous power to shape children's lives.
}

\title{
They know that it's not about heroic individuals.
}

That path, as we all know, is unsustainable.

\section*{But they have seen the awesome power of the collective-some describe it as the "huddle"-to lift children up.}

As well as the destructive power of individual adults to tear children down.

\section*{So they organize and celebrate the lifting, and they do not tolerate those who tear down.}

\title{
No, things aren't fair out there.
}

And we should fight hard to make sure families get what they need.

\section*{But in the meantime, we have enormous power to pave the path upward for far more children...}

\section*{And they need us to exercise that power.}

\section*{5. Accountability systems that set stretch goals for every group of children put leverage behind changeoriented leaders.}

Just as low standards undermine good teachers-who know that that level of work is not good enough-weak accountability systems undermine good leaders.

Those of you outside of schools, do the educators inside them—and certainly their students—no favors if you explain away poor performance instead of pressing for more.

You taught the country that in the 1990's, when your growth—especially for low-income children and children of color-led the nation, especially in math.

Please don't forget that lesson now.

\title{
Download this presentation on our website
}

\section*{www.edtrust.org}

\author{
Washington, D.C. 202/293-1217
}

\author{
Metro Detroit, MI 734/619-8009
}

Oakland, CA 510/465-6444```

